

CITY OF ORLANDO

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

NOVEMBER 7, 2001

MINUTES

On Wednesday, November 7, 2001, the Historic Preservation Board met in City Council Chambers, City Hall, Orlando, Florida. David Bass announced the presence of a quorum and called the meeting to order at 4:04 P.M.

Members Present:

David Bass, Chair [2/0]
Sheila Hill Vice-Chair [2/0]
Max Brito [2/0]
Gregory Bryla [2/0]
Crystal Jenkins [2/0]
Ted Maines [2/0]
Cindi Parker [2/1]
Cindy White [2/0]

Members Absent:

Jean Werth [2/1]

CONSIDERATION OF OCTOBER 3, 2001 MINUTES

1. Ms. White MOVED to approve the minutes of the October 3, 2001, Board meeting. Mr. Bryla SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Bass discussed the Consent Agenda and the procedure for removing an item from the Consent Agenda. He stated that any item(s) removed from the Consent Agenda would be heard first on the Regular Agenda.

Linda Painter, AICP, Chief Planner, provided a summary of each of the Consent Agenda items.

Cindi Parker arrived at 4:08 P.M.

2a. 230 Thornton Lane; #HPB2001-00204, Lake Lawsona Historic District (District 4)

Applicant: David Hanna

The applicant is requesting to construct a new, two-story house and detached one-story garage on a vacant lot.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council.

Ms. Jenkins MOVED to approve the Consent Agenda. Mr. Maines SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

REGULAR AGENDA

3a. **642 East Amelia Avenue; #HPB2001-00241, Lake Eola Heights Historic District (District 4)**

Applicant: Sheila F. Hill

Sheila Hill submitted a Memorandum Of Voting Conflict form.

Jodi Rubin, AICP, Historic Preservation Officer, stated the applicant is requesting to remove an existing porch and construct a one-story, gable-roofed, wood-sided, rear addition with wood windows, trim and doors to match.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council.

Ms. Hill, 1513 East Central Boulevard, applicant, stated the property owner's intent is to construct a powder room and laundry room in place of the porch.

Tom Connery, 632 East Amelia Street and Martha Morris, 647 East Amelia Street, spoke in opposition.

Board discussion ensued regarding:

- Overbuilding of lot
- Absentee landlord
- Design of addition

Mr. Bryla MOVED to accept staff recommendation. Mr. Brito SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

3b. **223 East Concord Street; #HPB2001-00220, Lake Eola Heights Historic District (District 4)**

Applicant: Jon Marsa

Ms. Rubin stated the applicant is requesting to construct a two-story structure in the rear yard containing three residential units.

Ms. Rubin gave the history of previous applications and an appeal regarding the 1950's Ranch-style house.

Ms. Rubin stated that Modifications of Standards are required for rear yard setbacks and a variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustment to build a 6-foot tall wall along the east lot line instead of a required seven-foot buffer-yard strip.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposal is subject to the applicant obtaining variances from the Board of Zoning Adjustment.
2. The Minor Review Committee must approve the wall prior to permitting.

Board discussion ensued regarding:

- Variance issues
- Land Development Code requirements
- Modification of Standards
- Zoning issues
- Condominium ownership rights

- Retention / exfiltration solutions

Jon Marsa, 223 East Concord Street, displayed a scaled model of the existing house, neighboring houses and the proposed structure.

Mr. Marsa submitted appearance forms in support of the proposal for William Waldren, 525 Highland Avenue and Delight Debolt, 226 Hibiscus Street, who were not in attendance.

Discussion between the Board and the applicant ensued regarding:

- Buffer wall
- Retention / exfiltration
- Rear terraces
- Impact to neighboring structures
- Landscaping
- Meetings with neighbors

Les Walters, 213 East Concord Street, spoke in support of the proposal.

The following spoke in opposition to the proposal:

- Kerry J. Kelly, 229 East Concord Street
- Thomas Carden, 216 East Concord Street
- Tom Connery, 632 East Amelia Street
- D. Gene Jernigan, 309 East Concord Street

Letters in opposition were submitted from:

- Ed Miesak, 222 East Concord Street
- Ailene Markham, 500 East Concord Street
- Illegible signature, 532 Broadway Avenue
- Velma B. Freeman, 202 East Concord Street
- Amanda Ellys, 205 East Concord Street
- Angela Gallogly, 323 East Concord Street
- Jacqueline K. Ryan, 209 East Concord Street

Mr. Marsa spoke in rebuttal regarding opposition to the proposal.

Mr. Kelly spoke in rebuttal regarding the size of the proposed structure.

Board discussion continued regarding:

- Precedent of allowing construction of three-unit condominium behind single-family homes
- Typical and traditional development
- Tandem development
- Zoning issues
- Condo ownership
- Non-contributing structures
- Denial of demolition
- Scale and massing

- Development rights
- Consistency of HPB decisions
- Setback issues

Ms. White MOVED to deny. Ms. White stated her denial was based on scale and massing, size and style.
Ms. Hill SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and FAILED by voice vote. Voting in favor to deny: White, Hill, Bass and Parker. Voting in opposition to deny: Bryla, Jenkins, Brito and Maines.

Ms. Painter requested the meeting recess until counsel from the Office of Legal Affairs was present.

Meeting recessed at 5:52 P.M.

Meeting resumed at 6:02 P.M.

Mr. Maines MOVED to accept staff recommendations. For lack of a second, the motion DIED.

Seth King, Assistant City Attorney, advised the Board to either make a motion that could be supported or defer until a time when a full Board is present.

Board discussion resumed:

- Providing direction and feedback to applicant
- Setback requirements
- Size and width of proposed structure
- Number of units in proposed structure
- Scale and massing
- DRC
- Setting precedent
- Traditional garage apartments
- Condominiums or garage apartments behind single-family houses
- Matching style and scale and massing to the main house

Mr. King suggested that if there is a lack of consensus the Board could defer until the December meeting and provide recommendations to the applicant.

Mr. Bryla MOVED to defer and provide the applicant time to reconsider downsizing the proposed structure. Mr. Maines SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

3c. **812 East Livingston Street; #HPB2001-00218, Lake Eola Heights Historic District (District 4)**

Applicants: Eric A. Schwab & Cheryl Belfay

Ms. Rubin stated the applicants propose to construct a rear two-story addition to a one-story Prairie style house constructed in 1925. She stated the applicants' house is a rare example of the Prairie style – a simple, rectangular one-story box.

Ms. Rubin gave a history of the house and a previous submittal to HPB on October 3, 2001. Ms. Rubin stated that the applicants and their architect had met with the Design Review Committee on two separate occasions. DRC made the following recommendations at the September 17, 2001 meeting:

- Integrate the massing of the two-story addition with massing of the one-story residence by moving the addition forward, creating a “rambling” effect typical of Prairie style houses.
- Create a smooth transition at the juncture of the existing roof and the new roof rather than two separate masses.
- Return the rear portion of the addition to one-story to create a gradual flow of massing.
- Submit a perspective view from the right front side of the house displaying a glimpse of the proposed massing from the street.

At the DRC meeting of October 18, 2001, the applicants and their architect agreed to develop three-dimensional images of the house and its neighbors to show that the proposed addition will not be visible from the right-of-way.

Ms. Rubin stated the applicants floated balloons at different heights and took photographs of same to depict right-of-way visibility of the proposed addition.

Ms. Rubin stated that because the addition, as proposed, will be visible over the ridge of the main roof of the house, it is inappropriate, as it will change the appearance, form and original character of the house.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council with the following conditions:

1. Lower the finish floor of the addition to two feet below the floor of the house.
2. Set the ceiling heights for each floor of the addition at eight feet.
3. Remove the screens and enclosure from the front porch and restore its original, historic, open-air character.
4. All revisions to be approved by the Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.

Board discussion ensued regarding any other examples of rectangular simple box one-story Prairie style houses in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District and removal of the porch screening.

Eric Schwab and Cheryl Belfay, 812 East Livingston Street, stated they have concerns regarding lowering the floor of the addition and reducing the ceiling height on the first floor.

Mr. Schwab displayed photographs of floated balloons at different heights, which depict right-of-way visibility of the proposed addition.

Mr. Schwab and Ms. Belfay stated removal of the porch screening would create a security problem and loss of use.

Jim Ross, 615 North Magnolia Avenue, architect, stated that due to the transitional corridor between the main structure and the proposed addition, reducing the ceiling height to 8-feet on the lower addition would create a 6-foot high entryway. He proposed lowering the upstairs ceiling height to 8-feet and a 9½-foot or 10-foot height on the lower addition and connector ceilings. Mr. Ross also suggested replacing the existing aluminum screen door with a more traditional wooden screen door.

Board discussion resumed regarding ceiling height and visibility from the right-of-way.

Lee Pharr, 815 East Ridgewood Street, completed an appearance form in support of the proposal.

Board discussion continued regarding symmetrical and asymmetrical examples of Prairie style houses and visibility of the addition.

Ms. White MOVED to exclude staff recommendation 1; amend staff recommendation 2 setting upper story ceiling height to 8-feet and lower addition ceiling height to 9½-feet; amend staff recommendation 3 to allow the porch screening to remain but to replace the screen door; and, approve staff recommendation 4. Mr. Maines SECONDED the motion. Board discussion commenced regarding size and massing, compatibility and uniqueness. **The motion was voted upon and PASSED by voice vote. Mr. Bryla voted nay.**

3d. **1513 East Central Boulevard; #HPB2001-00240, Lake Lawsona Historic District (District 4)**
Applicant: Sheila F. Hill

Sheila Hill submitted a Memorandum Of Voting Conflict form.

Ms. Rubin stated the applicant proposes to demolish a sleeping porch and construct a one-story, wood-sided, rear addition with wood windows, trim and doors to match.

Ms. Rubin presented a short history of the one-story wood frame, Craftsman style bungalow built circa 1920.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council.

Board discussion ensued regarding roofing, siding, visibility from right-of-way and windows.

Mr. Brito MOVED to accept staff recommendation. Ms. White SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

Ms. White left at 7:18 P.M.

3e. **24 North Rosalind Avenue; #HPB2001-00201, Landmark Building (District 4)**
Applicant: St. George Orthodox Church

Ms. Rubin stated the applicant is requesting a retroactive Certificate of Appropriateness to construct three additions to the principal façade of a Neo-Classical Revival style church built in 1928.

Ms. Rubin gave a brief history of the church and stated a Design Review Committee meeting with Father John Hamatie and Trevor Hall was held on August 20, 2001. She stated that DRC recommended removing the gabled structure and patching the exterior wall as needed and offered two replacement options.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend approval to City Council with the condition that prior to permitting and commencement of work, the Minor Review Committee will approve the final drawings and material selection.

Board discussion regarding DRC recommendations and lack of any drawings for the Board to review ensued.

Trevor Hall, 620 Trisman Terrace, Winter Park, spoke in favor of the staff recommendation.

Board discussion continued regarding metal cabinet design, removal of additions and previous DRC recommendations.

Mr. Bryla MOVED to deny. Board discussion regarding use of metal cabinet and pro-bono and grant assistance ensued. **Mr. Brito SECONDED the motion. The motion was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.**

OTHER BUSINESS

- 4a. Ms. Painter announced the resignation of Amy Stansberry, Historic Preservation Officer. She stated Ms. Rubin is returning to full-time status.
- 4b. Ms. Rubin reported that the HPB 2002 calendar should be ready for distribution by the end of November.
- 4c. Ms. Rubin discussed rescheduling the January 2, 2002 HPB meeting.
- 4d. Ms. Rubin stated a replacement for Ms. Werth from the Lake Copeland Historic District is needed.
- 4e. Ms. Rubin asked for consensus from DRC members on scheduling a DRC meeting. A DRC meeting was scheduled for November 13th at 1:00 P.M.
- 4f. Ms. Painter introduced Michael Haynes, Planning Supervisor.

ADJOURNMENT

5. The Chair declared the meeting adjourned at 7:30 P.M.

Staff Present:

Linda Painter, AICP, Executive Secretary
Michael Haynes, AICP, Planning Supervisor
Seth King, Esq., Office of Legal Affairs
Jodi Rubin, AICP, Historic Preservation Officer
Jill Galloway Strout, Administrative Assistant

Jodi Rubin, AICP, Historic Preservation Officer

Jill Galloway Strout, Recording Secretary