HISTORIC
PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ MAY 5, 2015

OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members and staff.
- Margaret Brock was honored for her time on the HPB.
- Consideration of the April 1, 2015 Minutes

CONSIDERATION OF THE APRIL 1, 2015 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the April 1, 2015 meeting. Sean Lackey SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5-0).

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2015-00067, 303 Harwood Street
   Applicant/Owner: Karen Consalo, 303 Harwood Street, Orlando, FL 32801
   District: Lake Eola Height Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a one story addition connecting the main house with the garage, replace the roof on the garage and house, and make alterations to the front porch.

   Recommended Action: Defer to the June HPB meeting per Applicant’s request

2. Case No.: HPB2015-00069, 721 Delaney Avenue
   Applicant: Tom Price, 552 Lake Ave, Orlando, FL 32801
   Owner: Elena Pethak, 721 Delaney Ave, Orlando, FL 32801
   District: Lake Cherokee Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing screening on the south porch with glazing that replicates the existing screen panels.

   Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

   1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
   2. Proposed applied framing to replicate the existing framing shall match the existing sizes as closely as possible.
   3. Glass shall be clear.

Revised 5/26/2015
Catherine Price MOVED to approve the Consent Agenda. Margaret Brock SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

3. Case No.: HPB2015-00066, 203 E. Amelia St.

Applicant: David Runnels, 233 West Park Avenue, Winter Park, FL 32789
Owner: Mitka Natchkova, 203 E. Amelia Ave, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing wood one story garage building and construct two additional two story buildings containing a total of two living units behind the existing house.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Reduce living square footage of second house to be equal or less than the historic contributing house.
3. All roofing and building materials shall match the main house and share similar proportions and details.
4. Any required new retaining walls adjacent to proposed new driveway shall match the existing walls.
5. Remove portion of existing curb cut that is on the east side of the property.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included maps, site photos, and graphics which show the living square footage and gross square footage of the surrounding structures in the district. According to the plans, the additional structures will increase the gross square footage to 6762 square feet and the living square footage to 5049. The main structure on the property was constructed in 1909 in the Colonial Revival style. The house is a contributing structure in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. There is a small wood frame garage to the rear of the house which is proposed to be demolished. The applicant proposes to construct a new house containing 2066 square feet of living space and a third structure proposed to be a garage apartment containing 1175 square feet of living space. The lot is zoned R-2B/T/HP which allows for 5 units. However, multi-family requirements state that the lot needs to be 90 feet wide to allow the proposed four units. This lot is only 75 feet wide which allows for only three units, requiring a variance to allow four units.

The Board inquired about surrounding multi-family properties and other larger structures, especially on the block face. Mr. Forbes stated that there are four units in one structure to the west, which is a non-contributing structure. To the direct east is a single family home. Further to the east on the block is a lot with four units in two structures and another lot with a carriage house with multiple units. Sean Lackey asked if this proposal meets code. Mr. Forbes stated it meets the zoning requirements but not the lot width requirements. The depth of the lot is larger than required as it is 200 feet where the minimal required lot depth is 100 feet.

David Runnels, 233 W. Park Avenue, Winter Park, FL, spoke as the applicant. He is agreeable to the Conditions in the Staff Report except for the limitation of the living square footage. Jeffery Thompson stated that living square footage dictates the massing and should be limited to ensure that the second house remains secondary to the primary contributing structure. Sean Lackey asked about the ceiling heights and roof pitches. There will be 9'4" ceilings in the two proposed structures. Mr. Runnels also stated that they have applied for the Variance.

Dena Wild, Chairperson, read into the record a letter from Diane and David Martens, 229 E. Amelia St, Orlando, FL 32801, in opposition to the proposal.

Board discussion continued on the size of the proposal, density of the lot, and the pattern of development. Mr. Forbes pointed out that the applicant originally proposed to create a large addition to the main contributing house. The applicant no longer proposes the addition but is now requesting the additional structure. Margaret Brock discussed the size of the second structure and stated it is too large to be considered a unit because it could be a free-standing building on its own lot. Dena Wild stated that this is a deviation from the pattern of development which is having one main structure that is larger than the secondary structures.
Jeffery Thompson MOVED to Deny the request.

Mitka Natchkova, 203 E. Amelia Avenue, Orlando, FL 32801, spoke as the owner of the property. She stated that she and her daughter’s family will be living in the second house as the primary structure which is why the structure is proposed to be larger.

Margaret Brock SECONDED the motion.

The Board discussed providing the applicant with clear direction; however, there was consensus that enough direction has been discussed through Board Discussion of the Case. Sean Lackey suggested submitting a profile to show how the houses will relate to one another.

The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a voice vote (4-1; Dena Wild opposed).

4. Case No.: HPB2015-00068, 632 E. Livingston St. (Lot 4)

Applicant: Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806
Owner: Tammy and William Arwood, 632 E. Livingston St, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 2200 square foot addition to the existing house and add a one story garage.

Recommended Action: Deferral of the request subject to the following conditions:

1. Deferral of the case because architectural design of the house and garage apartment is not approvable with the limited information submitted and the project shall come back before the Historic Preservation Board for additional review after the plans have been developed, clarified, and refined.

Richard Forbes introduced the case with a PowerPoint Presentation including photos of the site, Sanborn Map, existing survey, and the site plan. Mr. Forbes stated that the following two cases relate to this case as they are all lots associated with the same property. The contributing house sits on Lot 4, Lot 3 is empty, and a contributing garage apartment is on Lot 5. The applicant is proposing to demolish the rear portion of the house, swimming pool, and enclosure and construct an addition of approximately 2200 square feet. Mr. Forbes stated that there is little information concerning the demolition of the former addition and that no elevations have been provided for the garage.

Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806, spoke as the applicant. He would like to use the historic house less the modern rear porch and add a Master Bath, Master bedroom, kitchen, and demolish the 1991 addition. Margaret Brock discussed the layout of the lots. Mr. Kinchla clarified that this property has always been like a compound. Lot 4 and Lot 5 will continue as a compound and Lot 3 will be a free standing residence with a garage apartment. Mr. Thompson stated that the garage may be on the wrong side; if the garages were flipped, each property could have its own garage and driveway, which would fit the development pattern on the block and neighborhood. Dena Wild stated that the Board wants to know all details including materials, garage bays, orientation of the windows, and window patterns.

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to Approve Staff Recommendation of Deferral. Margaret Brock SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by an Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

5. Case No.: HPB2015-00084, 630 E. Livingston St. (Lot 5)

Applicant: Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806
Owner: Tammy and William Arwood, 632 E. Livingston St, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to make modifications to the existing carriage house and to construct a 2000 square foot, 2 story house with integral rear loaded garage.

Recommended Action: Approval of the concept subject to the following conditions:
1. Architectural design of the proposed house is not approvable with the limited information submitted and the project shall come back before the Historic Preservation Board for additional review after the plans have been developed, clarified and refined.

2. The proposed structure shall meet the height requirements and be no higher than the 30 feet allowed by code.

Mr. Forbes discussed the proposal and reviewed the Conditions of Approval. The Board asked Staff about the application submission process and the minimum requirements. It was suggested that applicants meet with the Design Review Committee prior to submission. Mr. Forbes reminded the Board that this project did come before Design Review Committee on November 19, 2014, however only conceptual information was provided.

Mark Kinchla spoke as the applicant and agreed that a Design Review Committee would be helpful prior to submission.

Janet Walker, 645 E. Ridgewood St, Orlando, FL, 32803, spoke as a neighbor and asked about the driveway orientation in the case that the owners move. Mr. Forbes explained that there would be an easement and the driveways will be shared.

Jeffrey Thompson MOVED to defer the case. Sean Lackey SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

5. Case No.: HPB2015-00083, 632 E. Livingston St. (Lot 3)

   Applicant: Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806
   Owner: Tammy and William Arwood, 632 E. Livingston St, Orlando, FL 32801
   District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new 3800 square foot, 2 story house with 750 square foot garage apartment.

   Recommended Action: Approval of the concept subject to the following conditions:

1. Architectural design of the house and garage apartment is not approvable with the limited information submitted and the project shall come back before the Historic Preservation Board for additional review after the plans have been developed, clarified and refined.

2. Reduce the square footage of the main house to a maximum of 3200 square feet of living space.

3. Reduce the size of the second floor living area of the garage apartment to match the lower floor.

4. Reduce the height of the attic floor and use consistent dormer type and size on both front and rear.

Richard Forbes discussed the empty lot and reviewed the Conditions of Approval for construction. The Board discussed that the most appropriate design for this lot would be a single family house with a garage apartment and driveway not shared by the adjoining property.

Jeffrey Thompson MOVED to Defer the case. Margaret Brock SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- There were no General Appearances.
- Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, reviewed the Minor Reviews approved in April
- Mr. Forbes announced that May is Historic Preservation Month. He briefed the Board members and invited them to the Month’s events. Upcoming events include: May 19th - there will be an unveiling of the Eppes-Shine Florida Historical Marker at Greenwood Cemetery; May 28th — will begin the installation of plaques a part the Downtown Plaque Program. The first plaque will be unveiled at the Wells’ built Hotel by Mayor Dyer and other dignitaries.
At the May 4th City Council meeting Mr. Forbes presented the Historic Preservation Awards. There is one more award to be given out at the Amtrak Train Station; however the ribbon cutting will take place in June.

ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Jason Burton, City Planning
TeNeika Neasman, City Planning

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary
Kyle Shephard, Chief Assistant City Attorney

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary