HISTORIC
PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ September 2, 2015

OPENING SESSION
- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members and staff.

CONSIDERATION OF THE AUGUST 5, 2015 MINUTES

Alyssa Benitez MOVED to approve the Minutes of the August 5, 2015 meeting. Jeffery Thompson SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (6-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2015-00145, 1908 E. Jefferson Street
Applicant/Owner: Jim Hanusek, 1908 E. Jefferson St, Orlando, FL 32803
District: Lake Lawsons Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing non-contributing structure and construct a two story 3090 square foot Craftsman style residence.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. The wide portion of the chimney on the east façade shall be raised so that it appears functional.
3. Windows shall have the same inset on both the first and second floor, have dimensional exterior muntins and ganged windows shall have mullions of a minimum of 7 inches between windows.
4. Windows west elevation: ground floor window closest to front shall be same height and width and second floor window
5. Window trim shall be similar to other contributing structures in the district
6. Add horizontal muntins to front door sidelights
7. French doors on front porch shall be similar and the east door may be a pair of doors.
8. Omit second floor accent brick for siding to match adjacent areas.
9. Porte-cochere does not appear to function, revise plan to allow drive to pass between house and supports.
10. Second floor windows on east façade shall be similar in width and height

Revised 9/4/2015
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the proposal with a PowerPoint presentation with images of site maps, site photos, the 1956 Sanborn map, illustrations to show the gross and living square footage of surrounding buildings, the proposed site plan, and proposed elevations. Built in 1952, the existing structure is a non-contributing resource in the Lake Lawsona Historic District. The existing house is a concrete block ranch style house and contains 1060 square feet of living space and 1112 gross square feet. In 2013, the Board approved a garage apartment which was constructed in 2014. This proposal includes demolition of the main structure and to construct a new two-story main house containing 3090 square feet of living space and 3648 gross square feet. Mr. Forbes reviewed the Staff Conditions and stated a correction to Condition 3 and asked that a Board Member add that correction to a motion.

Jeffery Thompson asked Staff to clarify the reason of Condition 9, which addresses the porte-cochere. Mr. Forbes stated that the proposed width does not appear wide enough for a car to pass through and that the applicant should increase the width of the porte-cochere. He stated that they may need to slightly alter the house plan to allow for this. Mr. Thompson inquired if there are two story buildings on this block face. Mr. Forbes said that there is not, but that there are some on nearby streets. Most of the houses on this street are ranch style houses and an adjacent duplex. Mark Lewis asked if each pier on the porch should have a column. Mr. Forbes stated that the column spacing as shown is common to the Craftsman Bungalow style. The Board also asked Staff about other architectural details including the fascia boards, the proposed double gable, and window sills.

James Hanusek, 1908 E. Jefferson Street, Orlando, FL 32803 spoke as the owner and applicant. He is agreeable to the Conditions and acknowledges he will need to make adjustments. Mr. Thompson asked what the purpose of the double gable is for. Mr. Hanusek stated that the double gable is to create depth. Sean Lackey advised the applicant to consider doubling the fascia thickness to be more authentic to the style.

There were no other comments from the public and the Board continued discussion of the proposal. Jeffery Thompson commented that the proposal is nice looking however may not fit the pattern of rhythm and voids of the block-face. Sean Lackey pointed out that the ceiling heights are reasonable and the proposed scale is a good representation of the Craftsman style. Dena Wild added that the massing is focused to the back of structure and that the neighborhood has a mix of one and two story houses. Jeffery Thompson suggested removing one of the gables in the double gable to diminish the massing.

Michael Arrington moved to approve the Request subject to Staff Conditions with the additional Condition 11. Eliminate the double gable on the front elevation; and Corrected Condition 3. Windows shall have the same inset on both the first and second floor, have dimensional exterior muntins and ganged windows shall have mullions of a minimum of 8 inches between windows. Alyssa Benitez Seconded the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and passed by a voice vote (7-1; Jeffery Thompson opposed).

2. Case No.: HPB2015-00146, 9 W. Washington St.

Applicant: Jerome Uhren, One South Orange Avenue, Ste 502, Orlando, FL 32801
Owner: David Siminon, Elixir, 9 W. Washington Street, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Downtown Historic District (Commission District 5)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to add a raised wood patio with trellis to west side of building; install a new hard canopy structure over south entrance; reconfigure parking lot entrance drive and install a wood fence.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Underside of proposed canopy to be finished to match the other canopies
3. Final finish of the canopy fascia shall be similar to final finishes on other existing canopies.
4. No conduit shall be visible under the canopy.
5. Omit TVs hanging under canopy
6. Pull south face of trellis and railing in from edge of building a minimum of 24 inches.
7. Trellis wood shall be stained to match other wood trim on the building.
8. Proposed fencing shall be stained to match other new wood features.
9. Any streetscape and parking modifications shall conform to City standards.

10. Recommend that brick column wrap be omitted and wood columns used as trellis columns.

11. Any future sidewalk café dining will require additional review.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included a site map, site photos, Sanborn Map, photos of the current canopy, proposed plans, and details of the floor plan. The original building was constructed during the 1910s by Silas Dolive. It was later doubled in size and in 1923 a second story addition was constructed. The Dolive family owned the building until 1988. Known as the Dolive Building, it is a Mediterranean Revival style structure with a flat roof. The applicant proposes to alter the parking lot to the west and add a patio with a trellis above, and add a new canopy to the south façade to match the Orange Avenue side.

Jeffery Thompson asked if the proposed columns are round or square; they are square. He also asked if Condition 9 addresses patching up the driveway/parking lot area; Mr. Forbes said that the new driveway would need to conform to City standards, as well as the sidewalk “bump out”. Mr. Forbes also answered questions about the proposed trellis, canopy, and transom windows.

Jerome Uhran, 2806 Granada Blvd, Kissimmee, FL 34746, spoke as the applicant an architect. He stated that he did not agree to push back two feet due to the loss of square footage; Mr. Forbes stated that the Condition is meant to make the trellis flush with the building. Mr. Uhran also addressed the Condition to remove the brick from the trellis columns. The interior of the building is brick and his client wants to bring this detail to the outside dining area. There is also a one-story brick portion of the building in the rear. Sean Lackey suggested angling the flat top of the railing to allow for better water drainage.

David Siminou, 1200 N. Lake Sydellia Dr., Maitland, FL 32751, spoke as the owner. He reiterated his desire for the brick columns. Mark Lewis suggested using a brick veneer, which is thinner than standard bricks to reduce the massing of the columns. Jerry Uhran spoke again, and explained that the columns are “double columns” to support the trellis which is why they are rectangular and not square.

Chairperson Wild asked Mr. Forbes if the proposed trellis will hide the brick walls, which it will when looking down the street. Historically, the Dolive Building would have had an adjacent building, which is why the building details only slightly wrap around the west façade and that the one-story portion was left as brick. Also, trellises are historically wood and not brick. Mr. Forbes reminded the Board that his Condition to omit the brick columns is only a recommendation. The Board continued discussion on the trellis.

Jeffery Thompson moved to APPROVE the Request subject to Staff Conditions with the additional Condition 12. The columns shall be modified and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (8-0).

Chairperson Wild asked Jeffery Thompson to clarify that his additional condition allows for brick. Jeffery Thompson stated that Condition 12 is intended to allow for a brick material.

3. Case No.: HPB2015-000147, 28 N. Brown Avenue, Orlando, FL 32803

Applicant: Danny Gaughan, 10814 Arrowtree Blvd, Clermont, FL 34715
Owner: Eddy Workinger, 244 Blue Branch St, Eustis, FL 32736
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing non-contributing structure and construct a new 2566 square foot, two story Craftsman style residence with detached one story two car garage.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Body of the proposed house shall be set back 25 feet from front property line
3. Windows shall be similar in style to historic wood windows, have dimensional, exterior muntins and paired windows shall have a minimum 8 inch mullion between them.
4. Windows shall be inset the same and similar to historic properties on both the first and second floor.
5. Window trim shall be similar to contributing structures in the district.
6. Add a minimum of two windows to the first floor, north façade.
7. Omit the false shutters.
8. Reduce porch width so that porch eaves align with edge of body of house.
9. The finish floor of the house shall be a minimum of 24 inches above grade and the house and porch shall have the appearance of a raised pier foundation.
10. Transparency on the street facing façade shall be increased by using pairs of front facing windows on both floors.
11. Eave depth shall be consistent.
12. Omit stone veneer on porch piers, use brick or rock face cast block.
13. Use a hip roof for both the main roof and front porch roof or at a minimum a hip or gable roof porch and side gable main roof to reduce mass of structure. If a side and front gables are used then they must also have appropriate decorative vent details.
14. Use a type of horizontal smooth siding for building body envelope rather than stucco. Gable ends may use a shake is desired.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site photos, neighboring houses, images to illustrate surrounding gross and living square footage, proposed elevations, floor plan, existing site plan and the proposed site plan. Mr. Forbes stated that the existing structure is currently condemned and that Code Enforcement has already removed an accessory structure. Mr. Forbes reviewed Staff Conditions. He also illustrated the Conditions and appropriate architectural details with photos of six two-story Contributing structures within the Lake Lawsona Historic District.

Jeffery Thompson asked about the eave widths, fenestration requirements, and front door. Traditional City standards require a 15% transparency on the front façade, however it gives no requirement for the side elevations. Mr. Forbes has created a Condition to add windows to the north façade. Dena Wild stated that these sizes should be clarified. The proposed front door is in the Colonial style and a Craftsman style door should be proposed.

Eddy Workinger, 244 Blue Branch St, Eustis, FL 32736, spoke as the owner. He is agreeable to Staff Conditions. The architect was not present to address the architecture questions of the Board.

Board discussion continued. Sean Lackey expressed concern with the lack of Craftsman details including projecting sills, beams within the gable, eave treatments, and the front door. He also commented that the fascia should be thicker and the bathroom windows should be more proportional. He is concerned, if approved with the long list of conditions and Board comments, that the final product will not be recognizable as proposed today. Mackenzie Carolan agreed; she stated that with a new roof shape, fenestration pattern, and other alterations, the Board would not be completely aware of what the final product would look like. Jeffery Thompson agreed that there would too many potential outcomes. He stated that the Board is in agreement that the demolition of the condemned structure should be approved and that the mass and scale of the proposal is appropriate. The Board discussed the options of a deferral, denial, or just approving the demolition today. Mr. Forbes informed the Board that a Demolition Permit can not be issued until the Building Permit has been issued, therefore a partial approval would not save the applicant any time.

Jeffery Thompson moved to DEFER the Request. Mackenzie Arnold SECONDED The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (8-0).

The Board encouraged the applicant to study the surrounding Craftsman style residences for appropriate styling, scale, and roof options.
OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances: There were no general appearances
- Richard Forbes reviewed the Minor Reviews issued for the month of August
- Chairperson Wild inquired about the 2016 Historic Preservation Board Calendar's progress. Mr. Forbes informed the Board that he is meeting with the Printer later this week and it should be unveiled at the first City Council meeting in November.

ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Jason Burton, City Planning
Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
David Bass, Assistant City Attorney

[Signatures]
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary