



# APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

MEETING MINUTES

February 18, 2016

## MEETING INFORMATION

### Location:

Sustainability Conference  
Room  
2nd Floor, City Hall  
One City Commons  
400 South Orange Avenue

### Time:

2:00p.m.

### Board Members Present:

Jeffrey Bush, Chair  
Justin Ramb, Vice Chair  
Matt Taylor  
Catherine Price  
John Paul Weesner  
Fulvio Romano  
Greg Witherspoon

## OPENING SESSION:

- Chairman Jeffrey Bush called the meeting to order at 2:06 P.M.
- Shaniqua Rose, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Jeffery Bush read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

## MINUTES

**A motion was made by Justin Ramb and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the January 21, 2016 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion carried unanimously.**

## ANNOUNCEMENTS

- There were no announcements.

**CONSENT AGENDA:** None.

## REGULAR AGENDA:

### 1. 223 -231 N. Magnolia Avenue

Owner/Applicant: Steven Wolk  
Location: 223-231 N. Magnolia Ave  
District: 5  
Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00003

Request for a Major  
Certificate of Appearance  
Approval for major façade  
renovations.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request  
with the following conditions:

1. The building design and style is consistent with that of a contemporary building of the size and volume intended. The balconies will make a definite improvement to the building facade and will provide a measure of shade/covering for potential outdoor seating cafes, etc.
2. The crown molding at the top of the building shall increase in size to be at least 10-12" in height so that it forms a definite crown or top on the building.
3. Final colors and details will require an ARB Minor Review prior to submittal of building permits to confirm consistency with this ARB Major approval.
4. Storefront Windows — The storefront windows shall be broken down into finer planes of glass by continuing the transom mullion across the entire module or storefront window.
5. Mechanical Equipment / Fencing

- a. All ground mounted mechanical equipment shall be screened from view by a vegetative hedge or opaque wall a minimum of 36-inches tall. This will be reviewed during the building permit review process.
  - b. All roof mounted mechanical equipment shall also be screened from view through the use of parapets, screen walls or louvered panels that, at a minimum are the height of the equipment they are screening.
  - c. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventor[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
  - d. Fencing—Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wrought-iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
6. Signage
- a. A Master Sign Plan for this property shall receive an ARB Major approval prior to issuance of the first sign permit for this building. Please contact ARB staff for the Master Sign Plan requirements.
  - b. All project signs shall require an ARB Minor Review prior to submittal of sign permits.
  - c. Monument Sign—Traditional city design standards do not permit a monument or ground mounted sign at this location. All signage shall be mounted to the building unless a variance is received for a ground mounted sign.
7. Permits Required - ARB approval does not grant permission to construct. All necessary building permits shall be obtained prior to commencement of construction activities.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the project and reviewing the conditions. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

Discussion ensued regarding the inconsistency between the contemporary second level and ground floor improvements. The board members also had concerns about the lack of detail in the application with regards to the proposed building colors, balcony treatment and tenant spaces for the facility. There was general consensus among the board members that there was not enough information available to make a decision on the case.

**A motion was made by Justin Ramb to defer the item based on the lack of details presented to the Board and seconded by Greg Witherspoon. The motion carried unanimously.**

## 2. 655 West Church Street – Soccer Stadium

Owner/Applicant:	City of Orlando/ Scott Neal
Location:	655 W. Church Street
District:	5
Project Planner:	Doug Metzger
ARB2015-00071	Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval Request to amend the approved Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the 25,200 seat Orlando City Soccer Stadium and associated site facilities.

ARB Staff has reviewed the Orlando City Soccer Stadium Major:

**New or amended conditions are shown in red.** Some conditions from the 2014 approval and the 2015 amendment have been removed or struck-thru either because they no longer apply or have been satisfied in this amendment package.

### 1. Streetscape

~~a. W. Central Boulevard—~~

~~i. The street trees on W. Central shall be high-rise live oaks installed with structural soil or approved equivalent.~~

~~ii. Sylvestri palms may be utilized in the two tree wells to the east and west of the mid-block Central Avenue egress location. The palms shall have a minimum 16-feet of clear trunk.~~

~~iii. The accessible ramps on either side of the mid-block egress location shall be located perpendicular to the accessible ramps on the north side of W. Central Avenue.~~

~~iv. There is conflict between the pedestrian clear zone crossing and the Service Yard Card Access and Intercom location that need to be rectified so the card reader is outside of the prescribed pedestrian clear zone.~~

~~b. W. Church Street—~~

~~i. The street trees along W. Church Street shall be high-rise live oaks installed with structural soil or approved equivalent.~~

~~ii. The first tree well west of the east parcel line on W. Church Street shall be moved to the east to align with the palm alley leading to the Church Street entrance gate.~~

~~iii. The second and third tree wells west of the east parcel line shall be removed to further enhance the impact of the palm alley.~~

~~iv. Sylvestri palms may be utilized in the two tree wells to the east and west of the mid-block W. Church Street supports deck. The palms shall have a minimum 16-feet of clear trunk.~~

~~v. The accessible ramps on either side of the Church Street Supporters Deck shall be located perpendicular to the accessible ramps on the south side of W. Church Street.~~

a. The Design Guidelines - All streetscape adjacent to the soccer stadium shall be designed and constructed in accordance with the standards and specifications of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines or as otherwise approved by the City.

b. Maintenance – Unless approved through a separate agreement the Downtown Community Redevelopment Agency [CRA] shall only maintain those portions of the soccer stadium improvements within the public right-of-way. The CRA shall not be responsible for nor maintain any section of streetscape not constructed in accordance with the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines or as otherwise approved by the City.

c. Minimum Width - At a minimum the streetscape zone on W. Church Street shall be 14-feet from back-of-curb and shall include Streetscape Furniture and Street Tree Zone [Furniture Zone] combined with an unencumbered Pedestrian Clear Zone. The minimum streetscape width on W. Central Avenue shall be 13-feet and shall provide furniture and streetscape Zone and an unencumbered Pedestrian Clear Zone. At a minimum Glenn Lane shall provide a 5-foot pedestrian clear zone or 6-feet if located on the back of curb.

d. Streetscape Finishes and Furniture – Streetscape treatments adjacent to the soccer stadium site should be consistent with the existing W. Church Street and W. Central Avenue streetscape treatments. This includes concrete sidewalks with saw cut joints; double-acorn LED street lights, the lights shall be perpendicular to the adjacent centerline; 4'x6' street tree grates with a 1-foot concrete ribbon band for high-rise oak street trees. Construction standards and specifications shall be consistent with the requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines. Other streetscape treatments and alternatives may be approved through an ARB Minor Review.

e. Curbing - Unless otherwise approved all streets shall have Type “F” curb with gutter.

f. Structural Soil - To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all oak street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.

g. Root Barriers - Where a canopy tree is installed within 10 ft. of any existing or proposed underground utility line a root barrier should be installed.

h. Utility Boxes—Utility boxes and covers in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade.

i. Crosswalks – Decorative crosswalks shall be installed at the Glenn Lane and Service Yard driveway crossings as well as pedestrian crossings in the Premium Parking and Drop-Off Area. Crosswalks at driveways shall be raised to be at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway in order to clearly define the pedestrian area. The driveway slope transition from street

grade to the sidewalk grade shall occur in the Streetscape Furniture Zone. The crosswalk surface shall be treated with a material, color or texture that contrasts with the driveway surface. Reflective paint alone is not an acceptable treatment, however may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to define the pedestrian path for night time safety. Refer to Detail 3.2K of the streetscape guidelines for more information.

j. Outdoor Speaker Permit— Audio and/or speaker systems on the exterior of the stadium that project towards the right-of-way shall require and outdoor speaker permit that complies with the conditions of the LDC and City's Noise Ordinance.

j. Vehicle Hardening—Any streetscape sidewalks that may be used to support motorized vehicles, maintenance vehicles or loading and unloading, including the east side pedestrian path between Church Street and Central Avenue shall be 6-inches thick in order to support the weight of motorized vehicles.

## **2. Service Areas, Mechanical Equipment, Utilities, Venting**

a. Service Area/Utilities - All utilities, trash disposal pick-up, and other maintenance facilities should be located on the interior of buildings, and not adjacent to the pedestrian sidewalks or streetscape zones to the fullest extent possible.

b. Mechanical Equipment - All ground and roof mounted mechanical equipment shall be screened from view and meet the conditions of the City Land Development Code [LDC] including transformers and other above ground utility structures and cabinets.

c. Telecommunications Equipment Screening - Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment (including any communications equipment required by the police or fire department). It is recommend that screening areas be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

d. Streetscape - In no instance shall any above grade transformer, utility box, traffic signal control box, backflow preventer or vertical impediment be located in the pedestrian clear zone.

e. Venting & Exhaust - All restaurant venting and restaurant exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the stadium structures, shall not be visible from the public right-of-way, and is not permitted on any façade of the stadium structures. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical equipment and utilities shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade, and shall be designed and integrated into the stadium structures so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the structures. Venting shall not occur over or be directed towards primary pedestrian areas.

f. Fencing - All fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wroughtiron picket fencing. Chain link fences are prohibited except for construction fencing.

g. ARB Approval — The final location of exterior or rooftop mechanical equipment, utilities and vents shall be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process.

## **3. Lighting**

~~a. Pedestrian Lighting —“Pedestrian Lighting Fixtures” are proposed at several locations on site, but the proposed fixture has not been provided. The proposed fixture shall be submitted to ARB Staff for review prior to submittal of vertical building permits.~~

b. Lighting Standards – Lighting shall comply with the Chapter 63 2M.—Outdoor Lighting in the city's Land Development code [LDC]. A signed and sealed lighting plan with photometrics consistent with the lighting ordinance or a photometric plan is subject to approval by the Planning Official and ARB Major Review. The submittal shall also include details of all proposed lighting fixtures on the exterior of the soccer stadium site. The final lighting and photometric plan shall be submitted for an ARB Minor [Staff] Review prior to submittal of final building permits.

c. East Side Pedestrian Path—The pedestrian path on the east side of the stadium between Church Street and Central Avenue will be an important neighborhood pedestrian connection. Significant pedestrian level lighting of the walkway area that provides a secure pedestrian environment after dark shall be provided and shall be in continuous night time operation.

#### 4. Master Sign Program

a. Intensified Entertainment District - The sign program for the Orlando Soccer Stadium should establish the district as a regional entertainment destination. With its strategic location near the Amway Center, and the proposed Sports and Entertainment District the soccer stadium should utilize many of the sign concepts from the City's Major Attraction Overlay District and Downtown Special Signage District; these special districts include digital signs and limited off-site signage rights that are oriented to the inside of the stadium.

~~b. Master Sign Plan— Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for the soccer stadium a Master Sign Plan shall be approved by the Planning Official thru an administrative determination, the City Council via ordinance [2 Readings] and shall also receive a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval from the Appearance Review Board.~~

c. Maximum Copy Area - Maximum allowable copy area shall be established in the Master Sign Plan.

d. Blended Maximums - Maximum allowable sign area shall be allocated and documented as part of the Master Sign Plan.

e. Sign Program Guidelines - The Master Sign Plan shall establish a uniform sign format or program for the soccer stadium site and include individual sign areas, design criteria, sign type, sign size and location of all exterior signs and sign spaces. The Master Sign Plan shall also include a wayfinding sign package and wayfinding system for the exterior of the stadium.

f. Exemptions – Inward facing Digital Screens and Roof Signs visible only to the sky shall not be deducted from the total sign allocation for the site, yet should be separately calculated and submitted as part of the Sign Master Plan.

g. Amendments - The Sign Master Plan may be amended as needed from time-to-time thru an Appearance Review Board Minor Review.

h. Sign Permit – A sign permit is required for all permanent and individual signs.

i. ARB Review — All permanent signage shall be subject to aesthetic and design review by the Appearance Review Board to ensure the overall theme and design criteria of the complex is maintained.

#### 5. Landscape and Hardscape Plans

a. Church Buffer— Provide a minimum 4 foot-wide landscape buffer along the western boundary of the church property that includes a 4-foot tall CTED fence beginning at the W. Church St. right-of-way line for 25-feet. After the first 25-feet the fence height shall transition from a 4-foot tall fence to a 6-foot tall fence for the rest of the length of the bufferyard.

b. Service Yard Screening—A minimum 4-foot tall landscape buffer shall be provided along the Glenn Lane perimeter of the Service Yard.

c. Premium Parking Area Screening—a minimum 3-foot tall landscape buffer shall be provided along the perimeter of the Premium Parking Area.

d. East Façade Tree Plantings— Four 4-foot by 6-foot tree grates with high rise oak canopy trees shall be added along the eastern edge of the pedestrian walkway north of the Pine Street stadium entry. The tree wells shall be centered between the pedestrian lighting fixture locations. Structural soil as specified in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used in the tree grate and surrounding areas.

e. Landscape and Hardscape Plans—Final Landscape and hardscape plans shall be reviewed during the building permit process.

#### 8. Architecture

~~a. South Parramore Avenue Terminus — Because the scoreboard structure has been moved further east the visual terminus of Parramore Avenue has been greatly minimized and lacks visual impact. The applicant shall continue to work with ARB Staff to develop a terminus design that anchors the stadium to the Parramore neighborhood and provides a significant architectural feature that enhances the quality and importance of this significant intersection and surrounding area.~~

~~b. Church Street Entry Feature — The lack of an architectural feature at the Church Street entry gate, the stadium's front door, diminishes the impact and importance of the entry area. The applicant shall continue to work with ARB Staff through the final design and permit process to develop an architectural feature at the Church Street entry gate that enhances the quality and importance of this significant location.~~

c. Durable Materials – A durable material such as stone, brick, pre-cast concrete, polished concrete terrazzo block or Thermochromax that extends from finished grade to 8-ft. above finished grade shall be provided along the exterior facades of the stadium. The use of stucco as an exterior building finish is permitted above 8-feet.

d. Principal Entrances – The principal pedestrian stadium entrances shall be architecturally treated and emphasized with canopies, awnings, enhanced hardscape, landscape or other material changes or architectural features.

e. Articulation – Not more than 30 ft. of any exterior façade shall be unbroken by architectural changes such as materials, colors, patterns, windows, columns, canopies, recesses, projections, pilasters, etc. Long single plane exterior walls should be avoided.

f. Transparency – It is understood that the functions and facilities of a stadium complex are unique and oriented inward. However, providing 15% of transparency along the exterior ground floor of the stadium structures is encouraged. Reflective glass, spandrel glass and glass block are not considered transparent materials.

g. Glazing - All glass at the ground level should be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%. No windows shall be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance. Tinted or reflective glass shall not be permitted.

h. Exterior Doors – At a minimum a 4-inch by 6-inch view panel shall be provided in all exterior solid doors that provide ingress or egress to the stadium in order to provide visibility for entering and exiting pedestrians. Mechanical and equipment room doors are exempt from this requirement.

i. Stormwater Run-Off - Water shall not spill out onto the sidewalk or plaza areas from any downspout, nor shall any downspout project into the public ROW. Canopies shall incorporate downspouts or other rain water management systems that prevent water spillage or drainage onto the pedestrian path or ROW.

j. West Central Avenue [North] Façade —

i. Art Panels

- Artwork for the fabric scrim art panels shall be reviewed and included in the Master Sign Plan.
- The artwork in the future may be changed as part of an ARB [Minor] Staff Review.
- The scrim panels shall be periodically replaced as needed in order to maintain and preserve the visual integrity and vibrancy of the artwork and the fabric scrim.

k. W. Pine Street [East] Façade —

i. Art Panels

- Artwork for the fabric scrim art panels shall be reviewed and included in the Master Sign Plan.
- The artwork in the future may be changed as part of an ARB [Minor] Staff Review.
- The scrim panels shall be periodically replaced as needed in order to maintain and preserve the visual integrity and vibrancy of the artwork and the fabric scrim.

l. Appearance Approval – Final architectural elevations and design shall be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit review process.

m. Model - Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' model of the stadium should be provided for the DDB/CRA model in the Downtown Information Center on S. Orange Avenue.

**9. The Church Street and Parramore Terminus Parramore Heritage should be visible from the public right of way.**



Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation reviewing the revisions of the project since the November 2015 ARB meeting and demonstrated that the applicant had met all of the previous November 2015 amendment conditions. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

Lawanna Gelzer gave public comments regarding the affect the stadium will have on the community including lighting impacts and buffering. The Board thanked Ms. Gelzer for her comments.

The Board thanked the applicant for addressing their previous concerns.

Chairman Bush stated his appreciation for the efforts of the Applicant, ARB Staff, the public and the ARB members through the stadium's ARB approval process. All of their input has led to a successful and significant stadium design.

*A motion was made by Matt Taylor to approve the item based on the conditions in the staff report, adding condition #9 and seconded by Justin Ramb. The motion carried unanimously.*

**NEW BUSINESS:** None.

**OTHER BUSINESS:**

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the January ARB Meeting:

- A. ARB2016 – 00005 – 201 E. Colonial Drive – Estes Meadow LLC – Demolition
- B. ARB2016 – 00007 – 436 S. Parramore Avenue – Parramore Place LLC – Awning fabric color change, paint exterior of building, replace exterior front doors and stucco exterior of building.

**OLD BUSINESS:**

The Board discussed concerns with Project Dox capabilities for their review process.


**ADJOURNMENT:** THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:36 PM.

**NEXT MEETING:** THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, MARCH 17, 2016 AT 2:00 PM.


**STAFF PRESENT:**

David Bass, Assistant City Attorney  
Thomas C. Chatmon Jr., Executive Secretary  
Doug Metzger, City Planning  
Terrance Miller, City Planning  
Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary  
Michaëlle Petion, City Planning  
Kenneth Pelham, City Planning

Richard Forbes, City Planning  
Frank Usina, Community Venues Project Manager  
Shannon Stegman, City Planning  
Jacques Coulon, City Planning  
Jason Burton, City Planning  
Walter Hawkins, Director of Urban Development



Thomas C. Chatmon Jr., Executive Secretary



Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary