MEETING INFORMATION

Location
City Council Chambers
2nd Floor, City Hall
One City Commons
400 South Orange Avenue

Time
4:00 p.m.

Members Present
Alyssa Benitez, Chairperson
Lucie Ghioto, Vice-Chairperson
Sean Lackey
Mark Lewis
Scott Sidler
Jeffery Thompson
Dena Wild

Members Absent
Vijay Marolia

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES • DECEMBER 7, 2016

OPENING SESSION
- Determination of Quorum
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Introduction of Board Members and Staff

CONSIDERATION OF THE NOVEMBER 2, 2016 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the November 2, 2016 meeting. Lucie Ghioto SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (7-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2016-00271, 1109 E. Jackson Street

   Applicant: Ashley Burleson, A&M Homes, LLC, 7320 Narcoossee Rd, Orlando, FL 32822
   Owner: Equity Orlando, LLC, 2255 Glades Rd, Ste. 324A Boca Raton, FL 33431
   District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing non-contributing single family home and to construct a new two-story single family home containing 3814 of living sq. ft. with a detached garage.

   Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

   1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
   2. Waive the required 180 day waiting period for demolition however, the demolition permit may not be issued until the permit for new construction has been issued per Section 62.709.
   3. Additional windows on east and west facades.
   4. Eliminate the bump out on the middle of the front façade, second floor, and tie the upper front facing gable to the roof line.
   5. Join the center second floor group of 3 windows into one bank with wide mullions between them similar to other ganged windows.
   6. All windows shall have dimensional exterior muntins to simulate wood double hung, divided light windows and be recessed similar to historic windows in the district.
   7. Window trim details shall be similar to other Craftsman style contributing properties in the district.
   8. Eliminate the double door and use either an extra wide single door or a single door and sidelights.
   9. Eaves shall be consistent with exposed rafters as shown on porch rooflines.
10. Rear porch columns shall have more design details in keeping with the style of the house.
11. Eliminate the circular drive area in the front yard.
12. Recommend reducing width of house to 42 feet.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site maps, site photographs, proposed survey, proposed elevations, roof plan, proposed garage elevations and gross square footage and living square footage comparison graphics of the Lake Lawsona Historic District. The 1956 Sanborn map showed that this house was not constructed at that time and showed that the current lot was cut from the neighboring properties. This is a non-contributing house in the district. The proposed new construction is loosely based on the Craftsman style.

The Board asked Staff about the neighboring properties, windows, fascia, and the material in the gable. The neighboring properties are both one story. The roofing material was not labeled on the plans, however, Mr. Forbes stated that the applicant mentioned a shingle roof in previous meetings. The material in the gable is suggestive of a board and batten design, which is a trait of the Craftsman style.

David Davis, 1201 E. Jackson St., spoke as the neighbor to the east. He is in support of the new construction but has concerns about the driveway setback, lush landscaping being removed, and the plain garage. He suggests more architectural detail be required for the back of the garage as it faces the lake. Mr. Davis also sent in a letter which was submitted into the record.

Brian Thomas, 1103 E. Jackson St., spoke as the neighbor to the west. He is also in support of the new construction but expressed concern about the front setback. He stated that there are large houses around the lake, like the proposed house, however those houses are on large lots. This large of a house is not as appropriate on such a narrow lot. He also suggested attaching the garage to the house as there are no garages set this far back on a lot with a lake in the rear.

The Board discussed the garage setback and Staff confirmed that the proposed setback is 50 feet from the lake. Jeffery Thompson stated that the garage should not be attached as that is not in keeping with the historic building pattern. The detached garage also breaks up the large massing of the house. The Board discussed the front setback of the house. Mr. Forbes confirmed the setbacks of the neighboring properties in relation to the proposal. The Board also discussed the existing oak trees, neighborhood patterns, windows, and proposed driveway. The Board discussed the many elements and issues of this proposal and deferring the case to the Design Review Committee to straighten out the design and setback issues.

Jeffery Thompson moved to DEFER the request subject to a Design Review Committee meeting. Scott Sidler SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Voice Vote (6-1; Mark Lewis opposed).

2. Case No.: HPB2016-00275, 721 Delaney Avenue

Applicant: Jason Lee, MJS Inc. Custom Home Design, 250 Wymore Rd., Winter Park, FL 32789
Owner: Charles Petz, 721 Delaney Ave, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Cherokee Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to repair termite damage to existing carriage house; extend existing garage, and to add a bedroom to the existing 2nd floor apartment.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Materials and details of the new additions shall match the existing garage and house.
3. Windows in the addition shall be similar to the existing windows in trim and installation and have exterior, dimensional muntins.
4. Allow a variance of 1.9 feet for the side yard setback of the proposed garage extension.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the garage, primary structure, existing survey, floor plans, roof plan, and proposed elevations. Mr. Forbes reviewed the previous request to demolish the garage and construct a new garage apartment. He stated that this request will rehabilitate the original garage and add an addition to the rear which will be slightly visible from the street. This proposal also seeks a 1.9 foot variance for the side-yard setback of the two-story garage.
The Board discussed the roof plan, windows in the garage, proposed size, and zoning. Mr. Forbes stated that the proposed garage is just under 1200 sq ft which is allowable in the R-1AA zoning. The Board noted the sensitive design and was favorable that this project proposes to repair the existing garage as opposed to demolishing the garage.

*Dena Wild moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions. Jeffery Thompson SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).*

3. Case No.: HPB2016-00278, 41 W. Church Street

- **Applicant:** Wes Featherston, Process Architecture, 1800 N. Orange Avenue, Ste. A, Orlando, FL 32804
- **Owner:** Church Street Ventures, Inc., 33 W. Church Street, Orlando, FL 32801
- **District:** Downtown Historic District (Commission District 5)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the historic façade by replacing the missing Vitrolite tiles, restore damaged stucco, replace canopy soffits, and recreate the historic signage.

**Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Any proposed tenant signage will require additional review.
3. The proposed entry doors will need additional review for material, details and style and shall have an appropriate bottom rail.
4. Stucco finishes shall be consistent above the canopy and below.
5. Paint color will require additional Minor Review.
6. Recommend replacing the storefront with a more traditional style or modifying it to comply with the 2003 stipulated settlement agreement.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the 1956 Sanborn map, site photographs, proposed elevations, and proposed signage plan. Mr. Forbes reviewed the history of the building, which was built in 1920 but is historically significant as the first J. C. Penney in Orlando which opened in 1940. At that time, the original brick structure was renovated to include the Carrara glass panels and a vertical sign installed extending above the roof. This proposal seeks to recreate the historic signage based on surviving pictures. Mr. Forbes reviewed Staff Conditions which included a recommendation to comply with a previous stipulated settlement agreement which was never complied with.

Jeffery Thompson asked what role the HPB has in determining the adherence to the stipulated settlement agreement. It was suggested by Counsel that the HPB review the case at hand. Because the HPB had previously issued a motion which was not carried out, that the Minor Review Committee should oversee any changes to that agreement. Dena Wild asked if a variance would be required for the vertical signage which extends above the roof, which is not typically allowed by code. Mr. Forbes stated that Staff would support such a variance based on the historical precedence and clarified that the recreated sign would not count against a tenant's sign allowance as proposed.

The Board expressed concern over the use of a trademarked company and questioned if they have the right to approve the signage as presented. There was a discussion on the content of the signage and if the owner or applicant could change the text or content if the J.C. Penney Company does not allow the usage of their name for the replicated historic sign. Jeffery Thompson asked if Staff's conditions make the J.C. Penney text mandatory. Mr. Forbes stated that it does not, however, approval is based on the plans as presented. He also clarified that he is mainly concerned with the restoration of the Vitrolite glass panels and the overall restoration of the building. The Board could make additional conditions that address the signage, if they do not approve of changes to the plans as presented.

The Board discussed similar cases such as the Cameo Theatre and Firestone rooftop signs, which were both recreated based on historic precedence. The Porter Paints sign, which is a Historic Landmark Sign was also discussed, as a proposal to alter the sign was recently denied.

Wes Featherston, 3024 Northwood Blvd, Winter Park, FL 32789, spoke as the applicant and architect. He stated that they are seeking approval from the J.C. Penney Company to allow usage of their name. He also worked on the Cameo Theatre sign and...
received the variance approval for that sign based on historic precedence. If J.C. Penney does not agree to usage of their name, then they would desire to use a generic version of the vertical sign such as the address of the building. He also addressed the Vitrolite glass and informed the Board that there is only one manufacturer in the United States and that they are seeking historic pieces from sites like EBay. He also stated that due to the high volume of foot traffic and the night-life nature of this area, they are proposing to use a more durable material such as Corian on the bottom 4 feet of the façade. They will match the Vitrolite as closely as possible.

Jeffery Thompson asked Mr, Featherston if the Corian would be too matte verses the glossy appearance of the Vitrolite. Mr. Featherston stated that they are opened to other options however would not suggest a natural or porous material such as granite. He also stated that natural materials often have a veiny, inconsistent appearance, whereas their aim is to have a consistent material where each panel looks identical. Painted glass was suggested and Mr. Featherston is open to the suggestion based on its durability.

The Board continued discussion on the vertical sign. They are in agreement that they view the vertical sign as an architectural element and would be favorable of the recreated sign as presented. Ms. Wild stated that it could be approved with no text at all and approved only as an architectural element if the Penney’s text is not allowed by the Company. Alyssa Benitez would be in favor of the address being used. Jeffery Thompson stated that he would want to know of any changes and that a change should be presented to the Design Review Committee. Mr. Forbes clarified that Staff Condition 1 states that any changes would come back to the Minor Review Committee and that recommendations from the Design Review Committee are not binding, whereas the Minor Review Committee can make binding requirements. A legal discussion ensued about the City and Board’s ability to mandate signage text and graphics.

Dena Wild moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions with direction to Staff to recommend to the Board of Zoning Adjustment to approve the historic based signage, Scott Sidler SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances
  - Doug Head, 1415 W. Robinson Street, Orlando, Florida 32805, spoke on his behalf and of Emmett O’Dell. He congratulated the Board on their approval of the Tinker Field History Plaza. He also reminded the HPB of their previous approval of the landmark which included the historic diamond not the entrance plaza. He encouraged the Board to ensure that the actual landmark is preserved.
- Announcements
  - Dena Wild presented the Board with a walking tour brochure of College Park
  - Richard Forbes remarked on the success of the 2017 Historic Preservation Board Calendar and provided each board member with a copy.
- Report on Minor Reviews (November)

ADJOURNMENT

Alyssa Benitez, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:50 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Mellissa Clarke, Assistant City Attorney
Jason Burton, City Planning

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Office

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary