HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES • FEBRUARY 7, 2018

OPENING SESSION

• Determination of Quorum
• Pledge of Allegiance
• Introduction of Board Members and Staff
• Consideration of the January 3, 2018 Minutes

Jeff Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the January 3, 2018 meeting. Mark Lewis SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (7-0).

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2017-10120, 1814 E. Washington St.

   Applicant: Walter Price Design Building Company, LLC, 750 Lanark St., Sanford, FL 32773
   Owner: Daniel and Leigh Rosenthal, 8 Via Hermosa, Orinda, CA 94563
   District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to remove and reconfigure non historic windows in the east wing, replace windows on rear and sides, restore front windows; and to and install new front door.

   Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

   1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
   2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
   3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
   4. All materials and details to match the existing house.
   5. New stucco texture shall match the adjacent historic stucco.
   6. New windows shall be similar to the existing historic windows.
   7. Proposed front door and sidelights shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate divided light panes.

MEETING INFORMATION

Location
City Council Chambers
2nd Floor, City Hall
One City Commons
400 South Orange Avenue

Time
4:00 p.m.

Board Members

Present
Lucie Ghioto, Chairperson
Laurie Burns
Beth Hobart
Mark Lewis
Kevin Motschall
Jeffery Thompson
Dena Wild

Absent
Scott Sidler, Vice-Chairperson
Tim Lemons

Revised 2/8/2018
8. All windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows and shall have mullions between ganged windows of 8 inches to be similar to historic paired windows.

Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the Consent Agenda. Dena Wild SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

2. Case No.: HPB2017-10137, 1607 Delaney Avenue

Applicant: HNR Construction, LLC, 1607 Delaney Avenue, Orlando, FL 32806
Owner: Daniel Zukoski, 1607 Delaney Avenue, Orlando, FL 32806
District: Lake Copeland Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing garage and to construct a two car garage with office and work and storage space above totaling 1620 gross square feet and 1146 square feet of conditioned space.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. Replace the fixed door panel on the second floor, north elevation, with a window to match adjacent windows.
5. Add a window to the center of the gable extension on the west façade.
6. Windows shall be inset the same on both the ground and second floor and be similar in style and details to historic windows in the main house and district and have exterior, dimensional muntin pattern. Paired windows shall have a mullion between them that is a minimum of 8 inches wide.
7. Gable end and eave design and corner board details shall match the main house and shall be subject to additional review by the Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
8. Waive the 180 day waiting period for demolition however, the permit for demolition may not be issued until the replacement building permit is issued.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation which included site photos, images of neighboring properties, the Sanborn map, the proposed layout, existing and proposed site survey, floors plans, roof plan, and the proposed elevations. He also reviewed staff conditions as shown above.

Daniel Zukoski, 1607 Delaney Ave., Orlando, FL 32806, spoke as the applicant in support of the request. He noted that a window on the second level under the gable would actually reduce his storage space. He also expressed concern with the request to add support brackets beneath the proposed overhang. Kevin Motschall stated that he was against swapping historic for non-historic fabric, such as the two-story accessory structure in question. He wanted a nod toward the original structure.

Board discussion ensued. Members talked at length about the need for additional fenestration. They also expressed their concern with the large size of the accessory structure versus the main house. Mr. Forbes noted that since the accessory structure would not be a living unit, it would not be subjected to the same size restrictions.

Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the case subject to staff conditions, with the addition of two conditions.
Condition 9: On the rear elevation, add a window on the second story gable, and a window to the main elevation.
Condition 10: Add brackets beneath the overhang of the second floor. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a 6-1 voice vote (Kevin Motschall voted against).

3. Case No.: HPB2017-10093, 218 Hibiscus Ct.

Applicant/Owner: Stephen Chun, 1901 S. Crystal Lake Dr., Orlando, FL 32806
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to retroactively approve demolition of a bedroom and utility room additions, removal of wood siding. The proposal includes installation of cement board lap siding, replace windows on existing structure and construction of an addition to the side and rear of the house. This request requires a variance to the rear yard setback of 15.79 feet.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All materials and details to match the existing house.
5. New windows shall be similar to the existing historic windows.
6. Doors shall have a muntin pattern compatible with the windows and simulate true divided light doors.
7. Cement board siding shall have a smooth finish so that when painted it will be similar in texture to historic wood siding.
8. New foundation shall match existing.
9. Porch posts shall have appropriate upper and lower trim.
10. Proposed eave and gable details shall be consistent with the existing eave and gable details.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation which included site photos, images of neighboring properties, the Sanborn map, the proposed layout, existing and proposed site survey, floors plans, roof plan, and the proposed elevations. He also reviewed staff conditions as shown above. He pointed out that this was a non-contributing structure in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. Finally, he noted that the proposed project was already in progress, and had been stopped by Code Enforcement.

Jeff Thompson wondered if the windows on the porch should be required to remain, and whether the porch should have wood siding. Dena Wild asked how similar the renovations should be to the original look of the house. Mr. Forbes said the applicant should follow the conditions, and “keep it simple” on a non-contributing structure.

Stephen Chung, 1901 S. Crystal Lake Dr., Orlando, FL 32806, spoke as the applicant in support of the request. He acknowledged his error in doing work without permits and without going through the HPB process. He did acknowledge that the windows had already been replaced by the time he bought the house about ten years ago. Board members inquired about keeping the porch kneewall. Mr. Chung said he would be willing to keep it if he could broaden the porch, but that it wasn’t on the plans.

Kevin Motschall MOVED to APPROVE the case, Beth Hobart SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).
4. Case No.: HPB2018-10005, 324 Desoto Circle

Applicant/Owner: Robert and Julia McLaughlin, 324 Desoto Circle, Orlando, FL 32804
District: Commission District 3

Consideration of Landmark Nomination proposal. The owners are requesting Historic Local Landmark Status for their home.

Recommended Action: Recommend to City Council to accept the Historic Preservation Board recommendation to nominate this site for Landmark Status.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, began by describing the code changes regarding the nominating procedure. He then introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation which included current and historical photos of the site. He explained the history of the house and possible architect. Board members were enthusiastic about its appearance and were ready to begin the nomination process right away.

Dena Wild MOVED to APPROVE the Landmark Request. Jeff Thompson SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances – there were no General Appearances.
- Report on Minor Reviews (January)
- Announcements
  - Mr. Forbes noted that Heather Bonds had her baby the previous day, which elicited a positive response from the Board members.
  - Ed Petersen, Recording Secretary, introduced himself to the Board, as he would be filling in for Heather Bonds during her maternity leave. He then reminded the Board that this would be the final meeting in Council Chambers due to the second floor renovations in City Hall. The meeting next month would likely be in the renovated art gallery on the ground floor.

ADJOURNMENT

Lucie Ghioto, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:07 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Ed Petersen, Recording Secretary (acting)
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney

[Signatures]

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Ed Petersen, Recording Secretary (acting)