OPENING SESSION

- Determination of Quorum
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Introduction of Board Members and Staff
- Consideration of the June 6, 2018 Minutes

**Jeff Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the June 6, 2018 meeting.**
**Tim Lemons SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5-0).**

CONSENT AGENDA

1. **Case No.: HPB2018-10149, 1917 E Jefferson St.**

   Applicant: Jeffery Smith, 1917 E. Jefferson St., Orlando, FL 32803
   Owner: Debra Lee Smith, Trustee, 1917 E Jefferson St, Orlando, FL 32803
   District: Lake Laswona Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 8’ deep x 22’ wide porch, reroof entire house and replace concrete drives and walks with pavers.

   **Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

   1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
   2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
   3. All siding and roof materials shall be similar to the existing materials.
   4. All materials and details to match the existing house.
   5. Proposed eave and gable details shall be consistent with the existing eave and gable details.

2. **Case No.: HPB2018-10153, 812 E Livingston St.**

   Applicant/Owner: Douglas Guy, 812 E Livingston St., Orlando, FL 32803
   District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing garage and construct a new 2 story garage with apartment above using similar design and materials to match the existing house. A variance of 10 feet is being requested to allow the garage to be 5 feet from rear property line where 15 feet is required by code.
3. Case No.: HPB2018-10157, 114 S. Lawsona Blvd.

Applicant: Richard Stubbs, 160 Ibis Rd, Longwood, FL 32779
Owner: Debra Comer and Ivy Gilbert, 114 S Lawsona Blvd, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing one story garage and construct a new two story garage with apartment above using similar design and materials to match the existing house. A variance of 10 feet is being requested to locate the garage 5 feet from the rear property line where 15 feet is required by code.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All materials and details to match the existing main house.
5. Waive the required 180 day waiting period for demolition however, the demolition permit may not be issued until the permit for new construction has been issued per Section 62.709.
6. All windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows and shall have mullions between the ganged windows the same width as the main house.
7. Windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the main house and be consistent on both first and second floors.
8. Window trim details shall be similar to the main house.
9. Final garage door selection will require Minor Review Committee approval.
10. Approval of the variance of 10 feet so that the garage is located 5 feet from the rear property line.
11. Shift the building over one foot or switch the location of the stair to the other side of the proposed garage so that the stairs do not encroach into the required side yard setback.
Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the Consent Agenda. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by an unanimous voice vote (5-0).

REGULAR AGENDA


Applicant/Owner: Kathleen Lawsona, 1004 E Central Blvd, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the noncontributing house and construct a new 2 story house with 2317 square feet of living space.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. The east elevation shall have additional fenestration in each room to be similar to historic houses in the district.
3. Roof material shall be an appropriate tile with roof eave details consistent with the Mediterranean Revival Style.
4. Roof tile, railing and stucco texture shall require additional Minor Review.
5. Waive the required 180 day waiting period for demolition however, the demolition permit may not be issued until the permit for new construction has been issued per Section 62.709.
6. All visible windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, divided light windows and shall have Mullions between ganged windows of 8 inches to be similar to historic paired double hung windows.
7. All visible windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in historic houses in the district and be consistent on both first and second floors.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site photographs, a Sanborn map image, proposed site plan, proposed roof plan, existing survey, proposed elevations, and illustrative maps to show gross and living square footages and 25ft front setbacks of surrounding properties. Mr. Forbes reviewed the conditions. He described the proposed architecture as Mediterranean Revival, which is a compatible style for this district. Mr. Forbes also stated that this site came before the Board in 2015 for a project which was approved to construct an addition, which was not done.

Jeffery Thompson asked if the proposed windows above the garage will have simulated divided lights; Mr. Forbes confirmed that they will. Scott Sidler asked about the need for additional fenestration; which will go through Minor Review. The Board also asked Staff questions about the doors on the garage, paint color, and roof material on the porch. The attached garage was also inquired about, which Mr. Forbes explained that there is precedence for an attached garage on Mediterranean Revival structures within the City.

Joseph Sirilla, 277 Cambridge Dr., Longwood, FL 32779, spoke as the applicant of the project. He asked if another roof material could be proposed instead of barrel tile due to cost constraints. The owner also inquired about the need for additional fenestration. Scott Sidler discussed the need for additional windows to break up the large plains of stucco.

The Board discussed the roof material and agreed that if the applicant intends to identify the architecture as Mediterranean Revival, then a barrel tile roof is a necessary characteristic. Other roof materials could be considered if the style was changed to the likes of a more vernacular style. Mark Lewis inquired if the base course around the house or just the front elevation, which it is shown only on the front elevation of the house and not the garage. Tim Lemons discussed this featured and agreed it should continue across the garage, as it provides additional Mediterranean Revival style features. The Board discussed the attached garage. Because it is recessed, the members were mostly amenable to it. However, the Board warned that if the style changed the style from Mediterranean Revival, then the attached garage would not be supported. Tim Lemons suggested lightening the color of the garage doors to diminish the attention to the garage.
Dena Wild MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions. Tim Lemons SECONDED the Motion.

Jeffery Thompson offered a friendly amendment to add Condition #8. The base course shall be extended across the entire front façade to include the garage and shall wrap around a minimal of 5 feet around the garage.

Dena Wild and Tim Lemons accepted the Amendment. The Board voted on the Amendment and it PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).


Applicant: Rafael Damas, 473 Citrus Lane, Maitland, FL 32751
Owner: Georgina and Pablo Roman, 116 James Avenue, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new 2 story garage with apartment above using similar design and materials to match the existing house. A variance of 10 feet is being requested to allow the garage to be 5 feet from rear property line where 15 feet is required by code.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All roof materials and eave details shall be similar to the existing house.
5. All siding materials and details to match the existing house.
6. All windows shall simulate historic wood, double hung, windows and shall have mullions between ganged windows of 8 inches to be similar to historic paired windows.
7. Windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the main house and be consistent on both first and second floors.
8. Window trim details shall be similar to the main house.
9. Garage shall have a carriage house style door to be compatible with the historic Bungalow.
10. Final design and details shall require additional review by the Minor Review Committee.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site pictures, images of the Sanborn Map, existing survey, proposed site plans, elevations, and an aerial image. Comparative maps illustrated the living and gross square footages, and two-story garage apartments with less than a 15-ft rear setback of the surrounding properties.

Mr. Thompson expressed disappointment in the quality of drawings and commented that it lacks the information to provide an adequate review. Dena Wild and Scott Sidler agreed that Staff and Minor Review would be tasked to iron out details, which is not the intent of that committee.

The applicant was not present and there was no public comment.

Dena Wild MOVED to DEFER the project until revised plans are received that adhere to Staff Conditions. Jeffery Thompson seconded the Motion.
The Board discussed the inadequacy of the plans. The Board directed Staff to inform the applicant that resubmitted plans should be complete drawings that define the roof pitch, window pattern and styles, scaling, and materials. The cut-out also needs to be shown clear to the sky. The Board also took issue with the configuration of the stairs, which are too modern. A more historic configuration should be utilized.

The Board voted on the Motion, which PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

6. Case No.: HPB2018-10179, 638 E. Livingston St.

Applicant/Owner: James Murdaugh, 100 S Eola Dr., Unit 1413, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to build a new 2517 square foot, 2 story house with 792 square foot detached garage apartment on the east lot (lot 3).

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.

2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.

3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.

4. All windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows and shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the district and be consistent on both first and second floors.

5. Windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the district and be consistent on both first and second floors.

6. Window trim details shall be similar to other Craftsman style contributing properties in the district.

7. Shutters shall be 1/2 the width of the window.

8. Cement board siding shall have a smooth finish so that when painted it will be similar in texture to historic wood siding.

9. The door on the left elevation shall either have traditional panels or French Door lights.

10. The sliding door at the rear shall be a French door with lights or at a minimum have that appearance.

11. Recommend shifting the house and garage back 5 feet so that the front porch does not come as far forward. This would require a variance to the rear yard setback of 5 feet to allow the garage apartment to be at 10 feet from the rear property line.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site pictures, images of the Sanborn Map, existing survey, proposed site plans, elevations, and street views. Comparative maps illustrated the living and gross square footages, 25ft front setbacks, and two-story garage apartments with less than a 15-ft rear setback of the surrounding properties. Mr. Forbes explained that he is recommending shifting the entire project back 5 feet to align the porch with the front setback of the neighboring properties along the block face. This shift would require a 5 foot variance be granted by the Board. Mr. Forbes also reviewed the case history of this lot, which was previously part of the lots to the west. Mr. Forbes showed images of another recent project with nearly identical plans that the Board approved.

Jeffery Thompson inquired if the cantilevered corner in the rear would have brackets that are common in this style and if the dormer roof line should be more subordinate to the main roof line. Mr. Forbes stated that he has found historic examples in the local area to give precedence to allow the roof line to be constructed as shown. Dena Wild inquired if the Variance request was noticed to the public. Mr. Forbes explained that the applicant is not requesting the variance and that it was part
of his conditions; therefore it was not noticed. She also asked about the rear windows on the garage apartment; which Mr. Forbes stated that the windows would need to be non-vision windows. This is part of the Code, which is why it is not part of Staff Conditions. The Board also discussed the fascia size, shutters, setbacks, and pattern of development.

James Murdaugh, 100 S. Eola Drive, Unit 1413, Orlando, FL 32801, spoke as the owner and applicant. He is agreeable to Staff Conditions including the shifting of the project. Mr. Sidler discussed the hodgepodge of the windows configurations and would like to see a consistency of type and grid pattern throughout the house.

**Jeffery Thompson** MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions with the alteration of Condition #9, to state “All exterior doors on the house and the garage shall either have traditional panels or French Door lights”; and the addition of Condition 12. Brackets shall be added to the cantilevered corner on the rear façade. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion.

The Board discussed the need to address the variance in the motion. Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney, discussed procedural actions about public noticing. The Board can approve the project, however, the variance will need to come back to the Board after proper noticing.

**Jeffery Thompson** amended Condition #11 to strike the approval of the variance of the garage’s rear setback and to require the condition, to read “11. The house shall be shifted 5 feet back so that the front porch does not come as far forward”. Mark Lewis extended his Second. The Amendment was Voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

The Board voted on the Motion, which PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).

7. **Case No.:** HPB2018-10181, 519 E Livingston St.

   **Applicant/Owner:** Mark Kinchla, 809 E Ridgewood St, Orlando, FL 32803
   **Owner:** Clara Ruiz Estate, 519 E Livingston St, Orlando, FL 32803
   **District:** Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to move the historic house from 330 Broadway Avenue to the subject property; demolish additions and restore the carriage house; construct a pool and guest cottage.

**Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.

**Conditions for relocated house from 330 Broadway Avenue:**

1. Any required new materials needed as a result of the move and removal of existing rear addition shall be similar to the existing materials.
2. All materials, windows and details in the proposed porch shall be compatible with the existing house.
3. The new foundation shall have a similar look to the existing.
4. Windows for the proposed sun porch shall require additional review and should be compatible with the historic windows on the house.
5. Eliminate the attached carport and second floor addition from the relocated structure.
6. Eliminate the second curb cut and driveway for the relocated structure.
Conditions for Existing Structure:
1. Any necessary stucco repair shall match the existing. No siding shall be placed over the stucco.
2. New garage doors shall require additional review and the garage door openings shall be square.

Conditions for New Structure:
1. Windows shall have dimensional muntins to simulate true divided light windows and be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the historic structures and be consistent on both first and second floors.
2. Doors shall have a muntin pattern compatible with the historic windows of the relocated house and simulate true divided light doors.
3. Cement board siding, if used, shall have a smooth finish so that when painted it will be similar in texture to historic wood siding.
4. Second floor may overhang ground floor facing pool and shall not overhang to the west and into the side yard setback.
5. Proposed eave and gable details shall be consistent with the final eave details on the relocated structure.
6. The final design for the proposed structure shall be reviewed and approved by the Minor Review Committee as there is not enough information to determine the style or details.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site photos, street views, a Sanborn map image, existing survey, proposed site plans, proposed elevations, and comparative maps. The structure at 330 Broadway Ave. is slated for demolition due to another development project and is being proposed to be moved to 519 E. Livingston St. The historic carriage house was constructed on site, but due to the Depression years, the main home was never constructed. The carriage house has been altered and the plans call for the removal of the inappropriate additions. Mr. Forbes explained the conditions which are separated out by each structure.

Jeffery Thompson asked if there was a detailed drawing of the proposed guest house. The Board also asked Staff to clarify the overall project, proposed parking configuration, lot size, and allowance of three structures and if having three structures on the site is against the historic building pattern. The zoning does allow three structures on this lot size.

Scott Sidler read two letters into the record:
- Janet Walker, 645 Ridgewood St., Orlando, FL 32803 - in opposition
- Gary Magarian, 808 E Harwood St., Orlando, FL 32803 - in opposition

Mark Kinchla, 609 E. Ridgewood St., Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the applicant. He desires to have the second curb cut to make the property more marketable. The Board discussed the driveway curbcuts with Mr. Kinchla and asked for additional details for the new construction. Mr. Kinchla also confirmed with Mr. Forbes on what finish should be on the carriage house, which Mr. Forbes stated that the historic material should be carried through, which appears to be stucco. The Board discussed the overall scope and agrees that the concept is acceptable, however several Board Members felt that more details are needed to approve the guest house to show how it ties-in with the other two structures. Mr. Kinchla also mentioned the possibility of a new basement similar to the current basement under 330 Broadway Avenue.

The Board discussed the overall project and the lack of details on the proposed new construction of the guest house. Moving the historic house is commendable and the Board is pleased to consider the project. The basement is encouraged, however, the overall height of the structure above grade will need to be reviewed. The Board discussed the development pattern of the neighborhood and that a second curb cut is not compatible with that pattern.

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions for the relocated structure and existing structure. The applicant is to submit refined drawings for the guest house. The Motion FAILED due to lack of a second.

The Board continued to discuss the lack of details of the third structure. Mr. Sidler felt that individualizing one structure within the motion may create a more convoluted process. The Board wants the applicant to know that they encourage the overall project but need more definitive drawings of the third structure to see how it fits into the overall project.

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to DEFER the project pending additional drawings to clarify the details of the guest house. Scott Sidler SECONDED the MOTION. The Board voted on the Motion, which PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (5-0).
OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances: none
- Announcements
  - Historic Preservation Board Calendar Photography Competition ended July 13
  - Judging for photography competition to be held August 8th at 4:30
- Report on Minor Reviews (June/July)

ADJOURNMENT

Scott Sidler, Acting-Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 6:20 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
Jason Burton, City Planning
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary