MINUTES • JUNE 21, 2018

OPENING SESSION

- Vice Chair John Paul Weesner called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.
- Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call and determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Vice Chair John Paul Weesner read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

NEW BUSINESS:

MINUTES

- Jeff Arms moved to approve the May 21, 2018 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion was seconded by Mike Mulhall. The motion carried 5-0.

PUBLIC COMMENT: NONE.

CONSENT AGENDA:

1. 301 E. Pine St.

   Owner/Applicant: Gina Penney
   Location: 301 E. Pine
   District: 5
   Project Planner: Doug Metzger

   ARB2018-10018 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval the installation of 4 wall signs.

   Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions
Staff recommends approval of the proposed TD Bank signage with the following conditions:

1. Any damage or discoloration to the building façade from the previous high-rise must be restored or repaired prior to installation of the new high-rise signs.
2. The final design and construction must be in strict compliance with the proposed design. Any changes must be requested in writing and significant changes will require a new ARB approval.
3. Approval is for the high-rise signs and doorway signs only, and does not include any other signs.
4. Individual letters must be individually mounted as shown; a connecting raceway is not permitted.
5. ARB approval does not grant permission to fabricate or install; any and all relevant permits must be acquired prior to installation.

Margaret Brock moved to approve the project with staff comments. The motion was seconded by Patrick Panza; the motion carried 5-0.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. 400 W. Robinson St. – DMS Zora Neale Hurston State Office Complex Plaza Renovation

   Owner/Applicant: Maxwell Spann
   Location: 400 W. Robinson St.
   District: 5
   Project Planner: Doug Metzger

   ARB2017-10004 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the renovation of the Zora Neale Hurston plaza area between the two office towers and the addition of ADA parking spaces on Beggs St.

   Recommended Action: ARB Staff has reviewed the proposed redevelopment of the Zora Neal Hurston State Office Complex at 400 W. Robinson and is recommending approval with the following conditions:

   1. Streetscape
      A. Streetscape Design Guidelines
         i. The Beggs Avenue streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.
         ii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.
         iii. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas.
      B. General Streetscape Requirements:
         i. Street Trees—Sylvestri palms, matching the palms on the south side of Beggs Ave., must be planted as the primary street tree on the north side of Beggs Avenue.
         ii. Structural Soil—To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas, structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4.0 and 3.4.1P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
         iii. Street Lights—Double corn LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines and matching the street lights on the south side of Beggs shall be used along the north side of Beggs Avenue and spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
         iv. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids. Box lids must be painted a color that matches the adjacent streetscape material.
2. Site Improvements—Design Intent — ARB Staff supports the design intent, site plan, materials, furniture and proposed finishes of the ARB application package.

3. Lighting
   A. Parking Area Lighting—Lighting must be provided for the side and rear parking areas. The light fixtures must be shielded and comply with the City lighting ordinance. The maximum foot candles [f.c.] at the property line must be zero f.c. per city code.
   B. All exterior lighting and fixtures will be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process. All exterior lighting must comply with the City lighting code and a photometric plan must be included in the permit documents.

4. ARB Approval
   A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commence of demolition and/or construction activities.
   B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

A Board discussion ensued regarding the dry retention pond. Jeff Arms suggested the applicant look into adding landscaping to integrate with the plaza design.

Jeff Arms moved to approve the project with staff comments and the additional condition that the applicant add landscape and aggregate treatments to the retention pond, this review is to be done at the staff level. The motion was seconded by Margaret Brock the motion carried 5-0.

2. 330 Broadway Ave.

Owner/Applicant: Mark Kinchla
Location: 330 Broadway Ave
District: 5
Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2017-10026 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval
for the construction of five (5) 4,010 sq. ft. living area 4
story four bed, four one-half bath townhouses
overlooking Lake Eola

Recommended Action: ARB Staff has reviewed the proposed Fountain Vu 5 townhouse
project at 330 Broadway Avenue, and recommends approval with
the following conditions:

1. Streetscape
   A. Streetscape Design Guidelines
      i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the
         Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines, as they may be amended from time-to-time, and the conditions of
         approval in this staff report.
      ii. Maintenance Agreement—If required, the applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define
         maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape and other aspects of the public realm.
      iii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the streetscape
          zone outside of the right-of-way.
   B. General Streetscape Requirements:
      i. Curb and Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts and curbing along the E. Ridgewood St. project frontage must be removed and
         replaced with concrete vertical curb during construction.
      ii. Sidewalks—Any damaged sidewalk panels must be removed completely and replaced. The pedestrian ramps at the
         intersection of E. Ridgewood and Broadway must be removed and replaced to Engineering Standards Manual
         specifications.
      iii. Existing Street Trees — The large existing oak trees, in the parkway strips between the sidewalk and back-of-curb, along
         E. Ridgewood and Broadway must be preserved. Trimming may occur to accommodate the new structure. However,
the City Arborist must approve any proposed trimming, prior to the trimming.

iv. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossings at the Broadway driveway cut must be level and at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway.

v. Pedestrian Clear Zone — No instance shall vertical structures or obstructions be allowed in the required pedestrian clear zone (sidewalk).

2. Tree Preservation/Mitigation—A tree removal permit is required to remove trees. As part of the tree removal permit process the Applicant shall work with the City arborist to evaluate the viability of the existing on-site trees and if any mitigation will be required for the removal of any trees.

3. Architecture
A. Windows—The windows on all facades shall be recessed a minimum of 1 to 3 inches from the façade to provide additional design texture and shadow lines on the building façades. The addition of window sills or trim treatments is also recommended.

B. Transparency
i. Per Traditional City requirements the ground floor building walls facing all streets must contain a minimum 15% of transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all other floors facing the street above the ground level.

ii. All glass at the ground level must be clear. Minimum light transmittance must be 80%. High performance or Low-E glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.

iii. No windows at the ground floor level may be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.

iv. Tinted, reflective, spandrel glass or glass block does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

4. Lighting — A lighting plan compliant with the City’s lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M ], including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures, must be submitted with the building permit documents.

5. Mechanical Equipment
A. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope must be screened, at a minimum, with landscaping on three sides that is 4-feet in height at the time of planting. Transformers should not be located between any façade and the street.

B. At-Grade Mechanical Equipment—At-grade mechanical equipment must be screened with walls and/or vegetation that is the same height as the equipment it is screening. In no instance may mechanical equipment be located between a building and any street, public or private.

C. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] must be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They must be clearly identified on the utilities plan.

D. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket, architectural mesh or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

A Board discussion ensued regarding the revised design. The Board suggested removal of “teeth” detail of the fascia, addition of lighting, and the detail of the rafters.

A motion was made by Margaret Brock to approve the project with staff comments with the additional conditions that the applicant add the front entry to be recessed to allow coverage from outdoor elements, exterior lighting be articulated, remove the “teeth” detail at the front fascia and increase the top fascia to be 3% of the size of the fascia below, rafters should be refined and simplified for more modern direction, add glazing to the front garage door, add additional 18'-'24' picket fence.

Jeff Arms added an Addendum to Ms. Brock's Motion that the design should include a patio feature on Broadway Avenue that is acceptable to staff and is generally consistent with previous versions.

The motion was seconded by Patrick Panza. The motion carried 5-0.

3. 409 N. Magnolia

Owner/Applicant: Raymond Stangle
Location: 409 N. Magnolia
District: 5
Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2018-10017
Master Plan for the redevelopment of the subject property with a new hotel.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

1. Appearance Review Board [ARB] Final Approval Required
   A. An ARB Major Certificate of Appearance Approval [CofAA] shall be required for the final project elevations prior to submittal of building permits.
   B. The future applications for ARB Major Certificate of Appearance Approval shall also include detailed site plans that include: dimensions, grading, roadway cross-sections, lighting, utilities, landscape, hardscape, signage and mechanical equipment plans including details, colors and specifications of all proposed building, surfaces, fixtures and plant materials.

2. Streetscape
   A. Streetscape Design Guidelines:
      i. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant must enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas inside of the right-of-way.
      ii. City Services Easement—A city services easement must be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.
   B. General Streetscape Requirements:
      i. Structural Soil - To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil, or a Planning Official approved equivalent, must be installed around all canopy street trees in the streetscape zone consistent with Detail 3.4.0 and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
      ii. Street Lights - Double arm LED streetlights consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines must be used on N. Magnolia Ave. and E Livingston St. They must be spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
      iii. Corner Treatments—Intersection corner treatments at N. Rosalind Ave and E. Livingston St. must be Lawrenceville brick and installed with a 6-inch thick concrete sub-base for the first 6-feet from back of curb transitioning to 4-inches to the outward edge of the 15-foot streetscape zone. Corner treatments at Rosalind and Livingston must provide two directional pedestrian ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline of the roadway they are crossing.
      iv. Corner Clip—A 10-foot corner clip may need to be provided at the intersection of N. Magnolia Ave. and E. Livingston St. in order to move the existing traffic signal pole outside of the pedestrian clear zone.
      v. Materials—Materials in the streetscape must be those approved in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. Specially paved and furniture other than those in the streetscape design guidelines are not permitted in the required streetscape zone.
      vi. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade hand hold and valve boxes in the required streetscape zone must be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids.
      vii. Building Entries—Doors must not swing open into the required streetscape zone. Building entries should be recessed into the façade so that ingress, egress and entry doors do not conflict or open directly into the pedestrian clear zone.
      viii. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossing at the Magnolia and Livingston entries must be raised to be at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway with a continuous Lawrenceville brick crosswalk. The grade transition from street grade to sidewalk grade must occur in the furniture zone. The driveway ramp may be concrete.
      ix. Curbing and Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts must be removed and the streetscape and the curbing along the entire project frontage restored during construction. All curbing in the ROW must be Type A curb and gutter per the Land Development Code [LDC] and Engineering Standards Manual [ESM].

C. E. Livingston Street:
   i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on E. Livingston St. must be a minimum of 13-feet from back-of-curb. The furniture zone must be a minimum of 5-feet along the entire project frontage. The concrete sub-base in the furniture zone must be 6-inches thick. The pedestrian clear zone [sidewalk] must be a minimum of 8-feet in width.
   ii. Treatment 2—The streetscape treatment on E. Livingston St. must match Treatment 2 of the Streetscape Design Guidelines. The furniture zone must be hex pavers. The pedestrian clear zone must be a minimum of 8-feet wide and must have a Lawrenceville brick window pane with infill concrete sidewalk cells. The sidewalk cells must have a 2-inch troweled edge with a medium broom finish. The broom finish must be perpendicular to the centerline of the street.
   iii. Street Trees—Street tree wells must be 6-feet by 9-feet, the use of tree grates is optional. The street trees on E. Livingston St. must be high rise live oak trees.
D. N. Rosalind Avenue:

i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on N. Rosalind Ave. must be a minimum of 15 feet from the back-of-curb. The furniture zone must be a minimum of 5 feet along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone must be a minimum of 10 feet in width. The sub-base in the furniture zone must be a minimum of 6-inch thick concrete transitioning to a 4-inch thick concrete sidewalk in the pedestrian clear zone.

ii. Treatment 2—The streetscape treatment on N. Rosalind Ave. must match Treatment 2 of the Streetscape Design Guidelines. The furniture zone must be hex pavers. The pedestrian clear zone must have a Lawrenceville brick window pane with concrete infill sidewalk cells. The sidewalk cells must have a 2-inch troweled edge with a medium broom finish. The broom finish must be perpendicular to the centerline of the street.

iii. Street Tree Wells—Street tree wells must be 5-feet by 9-feet, the use of tree grates is optional. The street trees on N. Rosalind Ave. must be high rise live oak trees.

iv. Sidewalk Cafe—A Sidewalk cafe may be permitted to extend into the 15-foot streetscape zone in front of the N. Magnolia retail/restaurant space. The sidewalk cafe must meet the requirements in the Land Development Code [LDC] including the preservation of a 5-foot pedestrian clear zone adjacent to the furniture zone.

3. Architecture

A. Design Intent: — ARB staff does support the design intent of the proposed hotel redevelopment project. ARB staff desires to work with the development team in order to advance the building design and to help deliver a distinctive project that will enhance both the Orlando skyline and life at the street level.

B. Brick Usage - Switching the use of the brick. Masonry Color #3 should be moved to the south wing of the building in order to compliment the brick of Trinity Luthern Church, Banner Project and to compliment the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. Masonry Color #2 should be moved to the north tower of the building.

C. Watertable/Wainscots—The height of Masonry Color #1 is ours of proportion with the rest of the facade and the mid floor transition is awkward. The transition from Color #1 to the dark brick above should occur below the bottom of the second story windows. Additionally a coping or trim transition element should be incorporated between Color #1 and Colors #2 and #3 above. Additionally a coping or trim band transition should also be added at the top of the building between the synthetic stucco area and Masonry Colors #2 and #3.

D. Artwork/Building Graphics—While possibly appropriate at the Magnolia and Livingston intersection, the proposed artwork/graphic patterns on the east and north facades should be removed or changed to something different, especially on the east facade. That artwork should be of a style and variety that compliments the historical character of the area to the east of the project site.

E. Transparency

i. The ground floor building walls facing all streets must contain a minimum of 30% transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency must be provided on all floors facing the street above the ground level.

ii. All glass at the ground level must be clear, except as noted in Condition E. above, with a minimum light transmittance of 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.

iii. No windows must be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.

iv. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

4. Lighting

A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures must be submitted for ARB staff approval prior to approval of vertical building permits.

B. It is encouraged that the top of the building be appropriately lit in order to make the building distinct in the night time skyline.

5. Mechanical Equipment

A. Rooftop Mechanical Equipment — Rooftop mechanical equipment must be screened to the height of the mechanical equipment with parapets, louvered panels or perforated metal screen walls.

B. Venting & Exhaust—All potential restaurant venting and exhaust must be directed to the roof of the building or the east facade and must not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted to vent over or towards pedestrian areas. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and other utilities must be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Vents and louvered panels must be painted to match the surrounding facade area.

C. Transformers—Transformers must be screened with decorative, opaque walls and gates up to 6-feet in height or they must be located inside of the parking garage.

D. Backflow Preventer—The proposed backflow preventer [BFP] location is too close to the Rosalind/Ridgewood intersection and is not acceptable. The BFP must be located so as to be not directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. ARB Staff's preferred location is in the 20-foot buffer yard on the east side of the parking garage. The BFP must be clearly identified on the final utilities plan in the Final ARB submittal. Backflow preventers may also be
incorporated into the interior of the parking garage.
E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

6. Signage
A. Master Sign Plan—A Master Sign Plan [MSP] for the building, including both low-rise and high-rise signage must be submitted for a separate ARB Major approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy. The MSP shall clearly show how signage will be allocated throughout the project including the type, style, location, and sign area.
B. High-Rise signs—The building is allowed to have two different high-rise signs because the project is inside the Downtown Special Sign District, those signs, if different can not be visible from the same vantage point. This will need to be adjusted from what is shown on the submittal documents.

7. Telecommunications Equipment Screening
Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

8. ARB Construction Observation
A. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with ARB Staff to review the ARB conditions of approval and the ARB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction.
B. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the ARB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the ARB conditions of approval.

9. Model
Prior to permitting, a physical 1"=100' scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

A Board Discussion ensued regarding the relocation of artwork, consistency with architectural statement, modernizing the massing, and adding textual change instead of a color change. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

OTHER BUSINESS
A. ARB Minor Reviews completed since the March ARB Meeting:
B. Creative Village Development Review Committee Projects for Approval:
   1. No cases for the May CVDRC, the monthly meeting was cancelled.

OLD BUSINESS: None

DATE OF NEXT MEETING
THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, JULY 19, 2018 AT 2:00 PM.

ADJOURNMENT
There being no further business to come before the Appearance Review Board, Chairman Fulvio Romano adjourned the meeting at approximately 3:47 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT
incorporated into the interior of the parking garage.
E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

6. Signage
A. Master Sign Plan—A Master Sign Plan [MSP] for the building, including both low-rise and high-rise signage must be submitted for a separate ARB Major approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy. The MSP shall clearly show how signage will be allocated throughout the project including the type, style, location, and sign area.
B. High-Rise signs—The building is allowed to have two different high-rise signs because the project is inside the Downtown Special Sign District. Those signs, if different can not be visible from the same vantage point. This will need to be adjusted from what is shown on the submittal documents.

7. Telecommunications Equipment Screening
Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

8. ARB Construction Observation
A. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with ARB Staff to review the ARB conditions of approval and the ARB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction.
B. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the ARB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the ARB conditions of approval.

9. Model
Prior to permitting, a physical 1” = 100’ scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

A Board Discussion ensued regarding the relocation of artwork, consistency with architectural statement, modernizing the massing, and adding textual change instead of a color change. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

OTHER BUSINESS
A. ARB Minor Reviews completed since the March ARB Meeting:
B. Creative Village Development Review Committee Projects for Approval:
   1. No cases for the May CVDRC, the monthly meeting was cancelled.

OLD BUSINESS: None

DATE OF NEXT MEETING
THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, JULY 19, 2018 AT 2:00 PM.

ADJOURNMENT
There being no further business to come before the Appearance Review Board, Vice Chair John Paul Weesner adjourned the meeting at approximately 3:47 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT
Thomas Chatmon Jr., Executive Director
Doug Metzger, City Planning
Ashley Edwards, Board Secretary
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney II
Kathleen Magruder, Planner II
Michaelle Petion, Planner III

Thomas Chatmon Jr., Executive Director
Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary