MINUTES • SEPTEMBER 5, 2018

OPENING SESSION

- Determination of Quorum
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Introduction of Board Members and Staff
- Consideration of the August 1, 2018 Minutes

Scott Sidler MOVED to approve the Minutes of the August 1, 2018 meeting. Jeff Thompson SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (9-0).

NEW BUSINESS

- The “Lake Lawsona National Register of Historic Places District” seeks to become the 7th NRHP District in the City. Mr. Forbes gave a history of the project and thanked the neighborhood residents who have spearheaded the work: Vivian Ward, Logan Lamphere, David Desforges and Jeff Smith, who were in attendance. Recommended Action: The HPB is asked to recommend approval of the nomination for the “Lake Lawsona National Register of Historic Places District” to the Florida National Register Review Board.
  - Dena Wild moved to APPROVE the Lake Lawsona National Register of Historic Places District” Nomination. Scott Sidler SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (9-0).

- The HPB was presented with a petition from the Lake Davis/Greenwood neighborhoods to request the consideration of a new local historic district “Lake Davis Greenwood”. Mr. Forbes explained Per Sec. 58.402 Establishment of Historic Districts. “…that a petition shall be presented to the HPB containing the signatures of not less than fifteen percent (15%) of the property owners within the proposed district, requesting that a public hearing be held to consider the matter.” Mr. Forbes explained that no Board action is required at this time.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2018-10212, 638 E. Livingston Street
   Applicant/Owner: James Murdaugh, 100 S Eola Dr., Unit 1413, Orlando, FL 32801
   District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

   The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to grant a variance of 7 ft. to the required 15 ft. rear yard setback for the previously approved two story garage apartment.

   Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. Place the previously approved garage building at 8 feet from the rear property line (Variance of 7 feet).
2. **Case No.:** HPB2018-10183, 400 Hillcrest Street  
Applicant/Owner: Robert Cascio, 400 Hillcrest St., Orlando, FL 32803  
District: Lake Laswona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to add dormers to the north and south facades of the main house and east facade of the detached garage using materials to match the existing house.

**Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All siding and roof materials shall be similar to the existing materials.
5. All materials and details to match the existing house.
6. New windows shall be similar to the existing historic windows and have 6 over 1 or 9 over 1 configuration of panes subject to review.
7. All windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows.

*Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the Consent Agenda. Scott Sidler SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by an unanimous voice vote (9-0).*

**REGULAR AGENDA**

3. **Case No.:** HPB2018-10189, 210 Hibiscus Court  
Applicant: Tom Price, 552 Lake Avenue, Orlando, FL 32801  
Owner: Austin Satterthwaite, 25 W. Rosevear St., Orlando, FL 32804  
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single family house on a vacant lot containing 1606 square feet of living space. A variance of up to 20 feet will be required for the rear yard as the porch and body of the house encroaches into the required rear yard setback. A variance to the front yard setback of up to 3 feet may be considered for the front yard setback.

**Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All windows shall have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows and shall have mullions between ganged windows of 8 inches to be similar to historic paired windows.
5. Windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the district and be consistent on both first and second floors.
6. Window trim details shall be similar to other Craftsman style contributing properties in the district.
7. All doors shall have a muntin pattern compatible with the windows and simulate true divided light doors.
8. Cement board siding shall have a smooth finish so that when painted it will be similar in texture to historic
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site photographs, a Sanborn map image, proposed site plan, proposed roof plan, existing survey, proposed elevations, and illustrative maps to show gross and living square footages and front setbacks of surrounding properties. Mr. Forbes reviewed the conditions. He also explained the need for the variances, which will bring the house forward aligning the front setback with the contributing structures on Hibiscus Court, which is made up of non-conforming lots.

The Board discussed height of the rear second floor railing, brackets beneath the gables, and the setbacks.

Tom Price, 552 Lake Avenue, Orlando, FL 32801, spoke as the applicant and architect of the project. He gave a brief history of the site and the multiple iterations of the elevations. Scott Sidler and Dena Wild complimented the compatible design.

David Martens, 229 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32801, is president of the Lake Eola Heights Historic Neighborhood Association and spoke in favor of the project.

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions with the addition of Condition #12, to state “Gable Brackets shall be added to each façade matching the front elevation”. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion. The Board voted on the Motion, which PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (9-0).

4. **Case No.:** HPB2018-10181, 519 E Livingston St.

   **Applicant/Owner:** Mark Kinchla, 609 E Ridgewood St, Orlando, FL 32803
   **Owner:** Clara Ruiz Estate, 519 E Livingston St, Orlando, FL 32803
   **District:** Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant requests a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to move the historic house from 330 Broadway Ave. to the subject property; demolish additions to restore carriage house; construct a pool and guest cottage.

**Recommended Action:** Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

Subject to the following conditions, the proposal is consistent with the requirements for approval of new construction contained in Sections 62.201, 62.705, and 62.706 of the Land Development Code (LDC):

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.

Conditions for relocated house from 330 Broadway Avenue:

1. Any required new materials needed as a result of the move and removal of existing rear addition shall be similar to the existing materials.
2. All materials, windows and details in the proposed porch shall be compatible with the existing house.
3. Add additional windows on the north side first floor where the existing addition is to be removed.
4. The new foundation shall have a similar look to the existing, including vents and be at a similar height above grade.
5. Windows for the proposed sun porch shall require additional review and should be compatible with the historic
windows on the house and be multi pane casements or ganged double hung windows.

6. Eliminate the second curb cut and driveway on Cathcart Avenue near the relocated structure.

Conditions for Existing Structure:

1. Any necessary stucco repair shall match the existing.
2. New garage doors shall require additional review and the garage door openings shall be square.
3. Proposed dormer shall have a roof slope of approximately 2:12.
4. Windows in the dormer shall be similar in proportion and pattern to the historic windows in the house and have the same mullion width.

Conditions for New Structure:

1. Windows shall have dimensional muntins to simulate true divided light windows and be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the historic structures and be consistent on both first and second floors.
2. Window muntin pattern styles shall be either 8/1 or 6/1 to be similar to the relocated house and be consistent.
3. Doors shall have a muntin pattern compatible with the historic windows of the relocated house and simulate true divided light doors.
4. Cement board siding, if used, shall have a smooth finish so that when painted it will be similar in texture to historic wood siding.
5. Proposed eave width and details shall be consistent on all sides of the structure.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included site photos, street views, a Sanborn map image, existing survey, proposed site plans, proposed elevations, and comparative maps. He reviewed the case, which was deferred from last month. The structure at 330 Broadway Ave. is slated for demolition due to another development project and is being proposed to be moved to 519 E. Livingston Street. The historic carriage house was constructed on site, but due to the Depression years, the main home was never constructed. The carriage house has been altered and the plans call for the removal of the inappropriate additions. Mr. Forbes explained the conditions which are separated out by each structure.

Jeffery Thompson inquired about Condition 5, pertaining to eave sizes for the new structure. Mr. Forbes explained that there are some discrepancies in the drawings and that Staff Condition shall require consistency of the size of the eave on all elevations. Kevin Motschall inquired what would happen if the historic home could not be moved and if the applicant would still be permitted to move ahead with construction of the new structure and making alterations to the carriage house. He inquired if a feasibility study would be required or any other insurance that the move will take place prior to issuance of any permits. Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney, stated that the Board could make a condition precedent to require that the house be moved prior to any other permits being issued. The Board also discussed the guest house construction, which will be slab on grade, and the proposed architectural style, which most resembles a Vernacular style.

David Martens, 229 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32801, spoke as a neighbor. He is in favor of moving the historic house to this lot but is opposed to the second curb cut, which is not in character with the historic building pattern.

Lucie Ghioto, Chair, noted that three letters were received and have been included into the record:

- David Martens, 229 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32801- in general favor with exception to the 2nd curb cut
- Janet Walker, 645 E. Ridgewood Street, Orlando, FL 32803- in general favor with exception to the 2nd curb cut and the carport.
- Raymond Cox, 600 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32803- in general favor with exception to the 2nd curb cut.

Mark Kinchla, 609 E. Ridgewood Street, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the applicant. He stated that plans to move the house have been in place since July and he has put down his deposits and has cleared the path with OUC. He stressed his personal preference for the second curb cut, as he will be the occupant of the historic house when it is moved and would like a convenient parking spot adjacent to the house and to not have to walk through the pool area between the house and the carriage house. Board members discussed the overall project including the additional curb cut, the location of the pool, and the layout of the site plan as they relate to the historic building pattern with Mr. Kinchla.

Alex DiVecchio, 322 E. Central Blvd. #1004, Orlando, FL 32801, spoke in favor of the project. Mr. DiVecchio has gone
door to door to gage support for the project and submitted a petition of 11 names in favor of the project including the second curb cut. He also included a letter in favor of the project for the record from Jason Edwards, 339 Broadway Ave, Orlando, FL 32801.

The Board discussed the impacts to the neighborhood, the building pattern, and the zoning codes pertaining to the second driveway. Per zoning, the property is allowed to have the three units. The Board was overall against the second curb cut and fears a precedence will be set for corner lots with more than one structure. They also discussed the mixture of architecture of the guest house and expressed a preference for the architecture to mimic the style of the main house. The Board also discussed setting a condition to block building permits for the guest and carriage house structures until the main house has been moved. Tim Lemons spoke about the layout and thought another configuration could workout some of these issues. Mr. Lemons stated that he was not against the second curb cut.

**Jeffery Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions with additional conditions.**

*General Condition 4. “Staff shall create a permit hold on the property to restrict the issuance of permits for the construction of the guest house or alteration to the carriage house until the main house has been moved to the site.” Conditions for New Structure, Condition 6. “Details of the guest house, including columns, railings, and brackets, shall match the styling of the main house or carriage house.”* Scott Sidler SECONDED the motion.

Kevin Motschall offered a friendly amendment to require the house be moved prior to the applicant beginning permits. After a brief discussion of process, Mr. Motschall withdrew the friendly amendment.

**The Board voted on the Motion, which PASSED by a Voice Vote (8-1: Lemons opposed).**

**OTHER BUSINESS**
- General Appearances: None
- Announcements:
  - Mr. Forbes reminded the Board that Elections for Chair and Vice-Chair will be held next month
- Report on the August Minor Reviews

**ADJOURNMENT**

Lucie Ghioto, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:25 p.m.

**STAFF PRESENT**

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary  
Jason Burton, City Planning  
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer  
Stephanie Herdocia, Clerk's Office  
Alexis Walker, Clerk's Office  
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney

(Names and signatures of staff present)